



EUROPEAN COMMISSION

Health and Food Safety Directorate General

sante.ddg2.g.5(2022)1698572

**Standing Committee on Plants, Animals, Food and Feed**  
**Section *Animal Nutrition***  
**08 - 09 February 2022**

**CIRCABC Link:** <https://circabc.europa.eu/w/browse/f634da84-30b7-4828-b425-29de0c803357>

<b>SUMMARY REPORT</b>
-----------------------

As mentioned in the invitation to the meeting sent out on 27/01/2022, the meeting was **held via videoconference** due to the situation derived from the COVID-19 pandemic.

The invitation provided relevant information concerning the modalities of the meeting and referred to the use of the written procedure for the delivery of the Committee opinions on the draft implementing acts under Section B of the meeting's agenda.

During the meeting, the following introductory statements were made by a representative of the Commission:

- The confidentiality obligations required by Article 13 of the Standard Rules of Procedure for Committees and referred to in the invitation to the meeting, were recalled.
- The modalities for the delivery of the Committee opinions on the draft acts under Section B of the meeting's agenda by written procedure, were explained.

**Section A Information and/or discussion**

**A.01 Feed Additives - Applications under Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 Art. 4, 14 or 13**

**A.01.01 Discussion of supplementary information submitted by the applicant concerning the application of synthetic CBD as feed additive**

The supplementary information submitted by the applicant has been discussed with the Member States delegations. Those were not satisfied with that supplementary information, since the major issue concerning the effect as feed additive and the difference from an effect as a medicament has not been clearly addressed. Therefore, an additional request to the applicant to better explain the scope of the product was considered necessary.

**A.02 Feed Additives - Applications under Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 Art. 9**

**A.02.01. Assessment of feed additives consisting of vitamin E for all animal species for the renewal their authorisation - ANNEX**

A discussion was held. A draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed at a future meeting.

**A.02.02. Safety and efficacy of a feed additive consisting of a tincture from the bark of *Cinnamomum verum* J. Presl (cinnamon tincture) for use in all animal species (FEFANA asbl) - ANNEX**

A discussion was held. A draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed at a future meeting.

**A.02.03. Safety and efficacy of a feed additive consisting of monosodium L-glutamate produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80187 for all animal species (CJ Europe GmbH)- ANNEX**

A discussion was held. A draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed at a future meeting.

**A.02.04. Safety and efficacy of a feed additive consisting of an essential oil from *Cinnamomum camphora* (L.) J. Presl (camphor whiteoil) for use in all animal species (FEFANA asbl) - ANNEX**

A discussion was held. A draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed at a future meeting.

**A.02.05. Safety and efficacy of two solvent extracts of rosemary (*Rosmarinus officinalis* (L.) when used as feed additive for cats and dogs (Kemin Nutrisurance Europe SRL)**

A discussion was held. Supplementary information will be requested to the applicant to complete the evaluation.

**A.02.06. Safety and efficacy of a feed additive consisting of *Bacillus velezensis* DSM 15544 (Calsporin®) for dairy cows and other dairy ruminants (Asahi Biocycle Co. Ltd.)**

A discussion was held. Supplementary information will be requested to the applicant to complete the evaluation.

**A.02.07. Safety and efficacy of a feed additive consisting of sodium aluminosilicate, synthetic, for all animal species (European Zeolites Producers Association (EUZEPA) & Association of Synthetic Amorphous Silica Producers (ASASP)**

A discussion was held. Supplementary information will be requested to the applicant to complete the evaluation.

**A.02.08. Safety and efficacy of a feed additive consisting of Allura Red AC for small non-food producing mammals and ornamental birds - ANNEX**

A discussion was held. A draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed at a future meeting.

**A.02.09. State of Play on the safety and efficacy of different silage additives (Article 14), and in particular:**

- **Assessment of the feed additive consisting of *Lactococcus lactis* NCIMB 30160 for all animal species (Lactosan GmbH & Co KG) - ANNEX**

A discussion was held. A draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed at a future meeting.

**A.02.10. Safety and efficacy of an essential oil from *Origanum vulgare* ssp. *hirtum* (Link) Ietsw. for all animal species - ANNEX**

A discussion was held. A draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed at a future meeting.

**A.02.11. Safety of vitamin B12 (in the form of cyanocobalamin) produced by *Ensifer adhaerens* CNCM-I 5541 for all animal species – ANNEX**

A discussion was held. A draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed at a future meeting.

**A.02.12. Safety and efficacy of Ethoxyquin as a feed additive for all animal species**

A discussion took place on the – not yet published – new EFSA opinion, which has been adopted on 27/01/2022, and on the consequential possible measure to be adopted. A Commission representative reminded that, on the basis of that opinion, the suspension measure concerning Ethoxyquin must be reviewed by 31/12/2022 at the latest, in accordance with Implementing Regulation (EU) 2017/962, as amended by Implementing Regulation (EU) 2021/412. Taking into account that EFSA could not conclude favourably on several safety issues, Member States delegations were invited to fully examine the EFSA opinion, once published, in view of the need to agree at the next Committee meeting on the measure to be adopted.

**A.02.13. L-Isoleucine produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80185 for all animal species (FAD-2019-0079) – ANNEX**

A discussion was held. Supplementary information will be requested to the applicant to complete the evaluation.

**A.02.14. Selenised yeast *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* CNCM I-3060, inactivated for all animal species (FAD-2020-0019) – ANNEX**

A discussion was held. A draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed at a future meeting.

**A.02.15. L-Lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species (FAD-2020-0067) – ANNEX**

A discussion was held. A new version of the draft Annex will be proposed at a future meeting.

**A.02.16. Endo-1,4-beta-xylanase and alpha-galactosidase for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying and minor poultry species for fattening and reared for laying (FAD-2020-0105) – ANNEX**

A discussion was held. A draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed at a future meeting.

**A.03 Feed marketing Regulation (EC) No 767/2009**

**A.03.01 Revision of Annexes**

The Committee discussed the establishment of maximum contents of CBD in hemp-derived feed materials and the maximum content of nutritional feed additives naturally present in feed materials.

The Committee will continue the discussion at a next Committee meeting.

**A.03.02 Feed for particular nutritional purposes - New application and state of play on pending applications**

A Commission representative informed the Committee that the Commission received the following new application for feed for particular nutritional purposes:

87 - Stabilization of the physiological digestion (KWS).

The Member States have been invited to evaluate the dossier, which can be found in Circa BC. Moreover, it has been stressed that supplementary information from the applicant has been uploaded for # 84 cardiac muscle feline royal canins.

#### **A.04 Status of certain products with regard to the scope of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 and feed additives to be withdrawn from the market – Update/New lists**

A Commission representative presented a slightly updated version of the working document concerning in a first part the list of additives to be withdrawn from the market under Article 10(5) of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 and in a second part the status of certain products with regard to the scope of that Regulation.

A discussion took place, focusing on the status of specific products. Before deciding on the status of any additional products, which are currently included in the Catalogue of feed materials and are proposed to be considered as feed additives, a case-by-case evaluation based on the criteria laid down in Recommendation 2011/25/EU should be carried out, in order to create a products' profile taking into account all the characteristics thereof. Accordingly, the Committee should endeavour to reach an agreement for the next meeting concerning the products on which a decision relating to their status as feed additives needs to be adopted.

#### **A.05 Discussion on the application of some aspects of new Regulation (EU) 2019/4 on the manufacture, placing on the market and use of medicated feed**

A discussion was held on how to implement rules concerning the validity duration of veterinary prescriptions for medicated feed containing antimicrobial medicinal products, as requested by certain Member States. Some Member States delegations explained their approach in this matter, which however still requires further discussion.

#### **A.06 Update on certain topics related to undesirable substances**

##### **1) RASFF**

##### **Update and exchange of views on recent RASFF notifications**

A Commission representative informed the Committee on the RASFF notifications related to undesirable substances in animal feed, issued since the meeting of the Committee in December 2021.

The notifications related to a too high level/content of:

- ambrosia seeds in sorghum from France (589 mg/kg), in sunflower seeds from France (> 50 mg/kg) and from Romania (56 mg/kg) and in organic soybeans from Croatia, via Poland (2525 mg/kg);
- hydrocyanic acid in linseeds from the Netherlands (414 mg/kg);
- aflatoxin B1 in sunflower seeds from Egypt (34.8 µg/kg) and in rice bran from the Netherlands with raw material from Pakistan (41.5 µg/kg);
- amitraz (0.042 mg/kg), matrine (0.097 mg/kg) and pyrrolizidine alkaloids (880 µg/kg) in organic bee feed (bee pollen) from Spain.

Too high level of isoprocarb was reported in corn distiller pellets from Belgium, via the Netherlands (0.22 mg/kg).

Furthermore, the attention was drawn to the notification on the unauthorised presence of ethylene oxide in fenugreek extract (0.22 – 1.2 mg/kg) used in compound feed from France.

## **2) Ethylene oxide**

The Committee was informed of the update of the minutes of the dedicated meeting on ethylene oxide which took place on 4 October 2021 discussing regulatory and technical aspects, as regards the approach to be taken related to findings of ethylene oxide in choline chloride and in compound feed containing choline chloride agreed at the meeting of the Committee in December 2021 (see: [Minutes of the meeting of 4 October](#)).

In addition, the Committee was also informed of the published minutes of the follow meeting on ethylene oxide that took place on 20 January 2022 (see: [Minutes of the meeting of 20 January 2022](#)). In particular, reference was made to the level applicable to premixtures (with and without choline chloride) and some further clarifications provided in the report.

## **3) Undesirable substances – outcome of the discussions at the meeting of the Working Group Undesirable substances that took place on 11 January 2022**

The Committee was informed on the outcome of the discussions that took place at the Working group meeting as regards regulatory provisions of:

- lead in humic acid and game meat for use in the production of pet food;
- rye ergot in feed materials and compound feed containing unground cereals and date of application;
- delta-9-tetrahydrocannabinol ( $\Delta^9$ -THC) in hemp seeds, hemp expeller, hemp seed oil, hemp flour, hemp fibre and complete feed;
- *Datura* sp.;
- dioxins and sum of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in fish oil, fish meal, hydrolysed fish protein and compound feed for fish;
- arsenic in fish meal and corresponding footnote, cadmium in copper (I) oxide, nickel in certain feed materials, endosulfan, heptachlor, hexachlorobenzene (HCB), hexachlorocyclohexane (HCH)-gamma isomers, p-phenetidine, unavoidable cross-contamination of authorised feed additives into non-target feed.

Other points that have been discussed/raised at the meeting of the Working group:

- regulatory provisions on quinolizidine alkaloids in lupins and lupin derived feed materials;
- ergot alkaloids;
- nitrites-nitrates;
- pyrrolizidine alkaloids;
- hydroxymethylfurfural (HMF) in bee feed;
- hydrocyanic acid (HCN) in linseed for birds.

## **Section B     Drafts presented for discussion prior to an opinion by written procedure**

The documents concerning the items under this section were communicated to the Committee members in advance of the meeting for possible comments.

During the meeting, an **exchange of views** took place on each of the draft measures referred to under items B.01 to B.11 in order to reach an agreement on the content of the respective documents.

However, as indicated during the meeting, the Committee opinion on the draft acts referred to under items B.04 and B.08 of the meeting's agenda will be sought at a later stage, after completion of preliminary internal procedural requirements.

After the meeting, a final version of the documents resulting from the discussions held during the meeting was sent to the Committee members for possible rectification or editorial comments, with a deadline for reply set on 14 February 2022.

In accordance with Article 3(5) of Regulation (EU) No 182/2011, the **written procedure** for the delivery of the Committee opinion on the nine draft Implementing Regulations concerned was launched on 15 February 2022 with a deadline set on 22 February 2022.

Member States representatives were informed on the outcome of the written procedure by a note sent on 24 February 2022. The Committee opinion delivered on each draft measure is mentioned below in relation to items B.01, B.02, B.03, B.05, B.06, B.07, B.09, B.10 and B.11.

**B.01 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation concerning the authorisation of butylated hydroxyanisole as a feed additive for cats**

The draft refers to the authorisation of an antioxidant as a feed additive for cats.

**Vote taken:** Favourable opinion.

**B.02 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation concerning the authorisation of great mullein tincture as a feed additive for certain animal species**

The draft refers to the authorisation of a flavouring compound as a feed additive for certain animal species.

The following declaration was made by a Member State delegation:

*“The Belgian Delegation vote against the draft regulation concerning the authorisation of great mullein tincture as a feed additive for certain animal species because the elements of the dossier do not make it possible to conclude on the efficacy as an aromatic additive. In particular because the draft authorization proposes a maximum use 1 000 times lower than the use level initially proposed in 2019, without reassessment of the flavouring effect.”*

**Vote taken:** Favourable opinion.

**B.03 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation concerning the authorisation of bitter orange extract as a feed additive for certain animal species**

The draft refers to the authorisation of a flavouring compound as a feed additive for certain animal species.

**Vote taken:** Favourable opinion.

- B.04 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation concerning the authorisation of ethyl acrylate, pentyl isovalerate, butyl 2-methyl butyrate, 2-methylcrotonic acid, ethyldeca-2(trans),4(cis)-dienoate, cyclohexyl acetate, 3,4-dimethylcyclopentan-1,2-dione, 4-methylacetophenone, 4-methoxyacetophenone, 3-methylphenol, 3,4-dimethylphenol, 1-methoxy-4-methylbenzene and 4,5-dihydrothiophen-3(2H)-one for all animal species and 2-methylundecanal, butan-2-one, 5-ethyl-3-hydroxy-4-methylfuran-2(5H)-one, phenethyl butyrate, hexyl phenylacetate and trimethyloxazole for bovine, pigs, poultry, salmonids and non-food producing animals**

The draft refers to the authorisation of 19 flavouring compounds as feed additives for certain animal species.

**Vote Postponed**

- B.05 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation concerning the authorisation of a preparation of *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* DSM 26571 as a silage additive for all animal species**

The draft refers to the authorisation of a silage additive for all animal species.

**Vote taken:** Favourable opinion.

- B.06 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation concerning the authorisation of a preparation of the leaves extract of *Melissa officinalis* L. as a feed additive for all animal species**

The draft refers to the authorisation of a flavouring compound preparation as a feed additive for all animal species.

**Vote taken:** Favourable opinion.

- B.07 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation concerning the authorisation of a preparation of lemon extract as a feed additive for all animal species**

The draft refers to the authorisation of a flavouring compound preparation as a feed additive for all animal species.

**Vote taken:** Favourable opinion.

- B.08 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation concerning the authorisation of expressed orange essential oil, distilled orange essential oil and folded orange oil as a feed additives for certain animal species**

The draft refers to the authorisation of a flavouring compound as a feed additive for certain animal species.

**Vote Postponed**

- B.09 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation concerning the renewal of the authorisation of a preparation of *Bacillus velezensis* DSM 15544 as a feed additive for weaned piglets, the authorisation for all avian species and categories, amending Implementing Regulation (EU) 2016/897, Implementing Regulation (EU) 2017/2312 and Implementing Regulation (EU) 2018/1081 and repealing Regulation (EU) No 333/2010, Regulation (EU) No 184/2011 and Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/893 (holder of the authorisation: Asahi Biocycle Co. Ltd., represented in the Union by Pen & Tec Consulting S.L.U.)**

The draft refers to the renewal of the authorisation and the authorisation of a zootechnical feed additive for certain animal species and to amendments to three Implementing Regulations.

**Vote taken:** Favourable opinion.

- B.10 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation concerning the renewal of the authorisation of sodium benzoate as feed additive for weaned piglets, the new authorisation for weaned piglets of other *Suidae* and repealing Implementing Regulation (EU) No 496/2011 (holder of the authorisation: Taminco Finland Oy)**

The draft refers to the renewal of the authorisation and the authorisation of a zootechnical feed additive for certain animal species.

**Vote taken:** Favourable opinion.

- B.11 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation concerning the authorisation of a preparation of 3-nitrooxypropanol as a feed additive for dairy cows and cows for reproduction (holder of the authorisation: DSM Nutritional Products Ltd, represented in the Union by DSM Nutritional Products Sp. z o.o.)**

The draft refers to the authorisation of a zootechnical feed additive for dairy cows and cows for reproduction.

**Vote taken:** Favourable opinion.

- M.01 Question on the interpretation of Article 18 of Regulation (EC) No 1069/2009 laying down health rules as regards animal by-products in relation to Regulation (EC) No 767/2009 on the placing on the market and use of feed, Annex III.**

**Can competent authorities authorize the feeding of maggots and worms produced for fishing bait, with manure?**

Fish baits intended to be attached onto a fish hook whose purpose is therefore not to meet the nutritional needs of an animal should not be considered as animal feed.

However, fishing baits designed to be scattered to attract fish to an area (often known as ground bait) are considered to fall within the definition of ‘feed’ as covered by Regulation (EC) No 178/2002.

Therefore, manure cannot be fed to insects which are to be used as fish baits (ground baits).



## **M.02 Use of sodium acetate in feed**

Further to a question raised by a Member State delegation, a Commission representative indicated that the removal of sodium acetate from the Register of feed materials notifications due to the feed additive status of that product, does not allow the provision of a regulatory transitional period for operators. Indeed, the legal status of sodium acetate was not modified, as it was not a feed material and should therefore not have been included in the Register of feed materials notifications. In accordance with Article 24(6) of Regulation (EC) No 767/2009, such Register is a tool managed by representatives of the European feed business sectors in order to ensure transparency with regard to the use of feed materials that are not listed in the Catalogue of feed materials and are placed on the EU market for the first time. However, the inclusion of products in the Register does not mean that they are automatically to be regarded legally as feed materials and a regular update of the Register should aim at avoiding any confusion with regard to the status of products.