

**EUROPEAN COMMISSION**

HEALTH & CONSUMER PROTECTION DIRECTORATE-GENERAL

Directorate C - Scientific Health Opinions

Unit C2 - Management of scientific committees; scientific co-operation and networks

**SUMMARY RECORD OF THE MEETING OF THE  
SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE**

Held on 16 April 2002 in Brussels

**Adopted 23 October 2002**

SUMMARY RECORD OF THE MEETING OF THE SCIENTIFIC  
COMMITTEE ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

Held on 16 April 2002 in Brussels

**List of Participants**

**MEMBERS**

Dr. R. Ahl

Prof. D. M. Broom

Dr. M. Gunn

Dr. P. Le Neindre, Chairman

Prof. Dr. V. Moennig

Prof. G. Panina

Prof. A-L. Parodi

Dr. M. Sharp

Dr. E. Vanopdenbosch

Prof. Dr. J. van Oirschot

Prof. M. Wierup

**EXTERNAL EXPERT**

Dr. S. Magnino

**COMMISSION**

Dr. J. Serratos

Mr. R. Horgan

Ms. S. Iñigo-Nunez

Ms. N. Alvarez Ruiz

Ms. C. Favre

Dr. J. Claxton

**APOLOGIES**

Dr. D. Alexander

Dr. H. Blokhuis

Dr. R. Dantzer

Dr. P. Have

Prof. P. Jensen

Dr. D. B. Morton

Prof. J. Noordhuizen

Prof. M. Verga

**SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE ON  
ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE**

Held on 16 April 2002 in Brussels

**1. Welcome and apologies**

Apologies and attendance are listed on pages 1 and 2.

**2. Adoption of the agenda**

The agenda was adopted after some modifications. A number of additional items were proposed for discussion under “Miscellaneous”.

**3. Declarations of interest**

No member reported any conflict of interest relating to matters under discussion at today’s meeting.

**4. Approval and adoption of the minutes of the previous meeting of the Committee**

The summary record of the meeting of 5<sup>th</sup> February was adopted.

**5. Report from the Sub-Committee on Animal Health (Dr R. Ahl)**

The last meeting of the sub-committee on animal health (SCAH) took place in Brussels on 20<sup>th</sup> March 2002. The main item at this meeting was the final discussion on the report on “Avian Chlamydiosis as a zoonotic disease and risk reduction strategies”. After a careful and detailed discussion the report was approved by the sub-committee. Since the Working Group (WG) chairman will be unable to attend the next plenary meeting it was proposed to invite Dr. Simone Magnino, member of the Chlamydiosis WG, as expert to the next SCAHAW meeting.

An interim report on the vaccination of foxes against rabies was presented by the chairman of the WG. The draft report is planned to be discussed at the next SCAH meeting.

Contributions to the list of research priorities had been collected by Ms. Silvia Iñigo-Nunez. The list was presented and briefly discussed. Ms. Silvia Iñigo-Nunez and Ms. Caroline Favre gave a presentation on the CIRCA service project of the EU Commission for data communication.

A new request from the Commission concerning the application of new techniques, in particular PCR, for the diagnosis of important infectious diseases in animals was presented by the Secretary. This request was welcomed and will be dealt with further when details have been clarified. The circumstances regarding the proposed reply of Dr. Pierre Le Neindre to the Cabinet of Commissioner Byrne concerning the report on welfare aspects of the production of foie gras were briefly discussed.

**6. Report from the Sub-Committee on Animal Welfare (Prof. Broom)**

The sub-committee has not met since the last plenary meeting, as the meeting planned for the 19<sup>th</sup> March was cancelled. The WG on the welfare of primates kept for use in laboratory research has met twice and has drafted a first document, which is expected to be ready in June. The next meeting of this group is planned to be held in Göttingen on the 7-8<sup>th</sup> of May.

The report on the welfare of animals during transport will be followed by a similar report covering a number of species which were not included in the one already accepted. It has not yet been decided whether a new WG should be elected for the preparation of this report. A list of suggested experts for a WG on the welfare aspects of stunning methods has been provided by the chairman of the WG. The WG will be appointed as soon as possible.

The next meeting of the sub-committee is planned for the 15<sup>th</sup> May.

**7. Discussion and possible adoption by the Committee of a report on “Avian chlamydiosis as a zoonotic disease and risk reduction strategies”**

The Chairman welcomed Dr. Simone Magnino of the WG who gave a comprehensive introduction to the draft report. The report was discussed in detail and the Committee members suggested some amendments and clarifications. The report was unanimously adopted, subject to final editorial changes.

**8. Miscellaneous.**

**8.1-** Dr. John Claxton of DG Research thanked the Committee members for their submission on research priorities for the 6<sup>th</sup> Framework Programme, and reminded them of the seminar entitled “European Commission supported research in farm animal welfare: current work and future directions” taking place in Brussels on 23<sup>rd</sup> April.

**8.2-** A request for a new opinion on advances in diagnostics and vaccination for some List A OIE diseases was also discussed. The Committee welcomed this request and decided to establish two WGs, one dealing with advances in diagnostic techniques and the other considering vaccine developments. A chairman was proposed for each WG. Input will be requested from the Animal Welfare Sub-Committee when formulating recommendations on the potential applications of these advanced diagnostic and vaccination techniques. The Committee considers that the effect of disease-control strategies on animal welfare, including animal health, is an important issue and separate to the ethical issue of the destruction of animals.

**8.3-** The Chairman updated Committee members on issues discussed at the last Scientific Steering Committee meeting of 4-5<sup>th</sup> April.

**8.4-** Correspondence received from the members of the WG on the welfare of animals kept for fur production was discussed. The letter received from members of the WG in response to the publication of an erratum to the report will be published as an Annex to the minutes of this meeting. As requested by the WG members, the additional paragraph being inserted in the acknowledgements to the report will be placed prior to the names of the WG members.

**8.5-** Correspondence received regarding the report on welfare aspects of the production of foie gras in ducks and geese was also briefly discussed.

**8.6-** Ms. Silvia Iñigo-Nunez and Ms. Caroline Favre introduced the “CIRCA” system, a web-environment tool facilitating the exchange of information among Committee members.

**8.7-** A discussion on communication issues regarding Opinions of the Committee was postponed until the next plenary meeting.

## Annex

Dear SCAHAW,

**Re : "The Welfare of Animals Kept for Fur Production", report adopted on 13 December 2001 by the Scientific Committee on Animal Health and Animal Welfare**

We thank you for your answer to our protest letter dated 3rd January 2002.

We do not find that your answer, following your meeting on 5 February 2002, meet our protest, and we still have reservations regarding some conclusions and recommendations, i.e. those without a scientific basis. The lack of full incorporation of references into the Mink chapters is still inadequate, and your claim that most of your changes had been merely editorial is neither credible nor scientifically justified. Furthermore we do not find that there is a satisfying justification of the many deletions you have made downplaying the vast amount of studies showing positive aspects of welfare of fur animals.

We are satisfied that you have chosen to publish our "protest-letter" and we wish our names to stay on the letter.

We also ask you to place the added paragraph explaining that "the members of the working group may therefore not necessarily agree....." prior to our names and not beneath them.

Finally, though still feeling disappointed and dismayed, we want to be acknowledged for the hard work we actually have done, and we agree to have our names mentioned in the adopted version.

### 1. CONCLUSIONS

- 1) Publish our "protest letter" in its whole on Internet, with our names
- 2) Make the corrections and additions you suggested
- 3) Place the added paragraph prior to our names in the adopted report
- 4) Publish this letter on Internet, together with our first letter

Yours sincerely

Vivi Pedersen  
Bjarne O. Braastad  
Georgia Mason  
Teppo Rekilä  
Erik Smeds

A letter will be sent with signatures from the above scientists