

**European Union comments on**  
**Codex Circular Letter CL 2016/29-FFV**  
**Request for Comments at step 6 on the draft Standards for Garlic and**  
**Kiwifruit**

**Specific comments on the draft standard for garlic**

<b>Paragraph and section number</b>	<b>Original text</b>	<b>Proposed text</b>	<b>Reason for the change/inclusion</b>
1. Scope		<p><b>The purpose of the standard is to define the quality requirements for Garlic at the export-control stage after preparation and packaging. However, if applied at stages following packaging, products may show in relation to the requirements of the standard:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>• a slight lack of freshness and turgidity;</b></li> <li><b>• for products graded in classes other than the “Extra” Class, a slight deterioration due to their development and their tendency to perish.</b></li> </ul> <p><b>The holder/seller of products may not display such products or offer them for sale, or deliver or market them in any manner other than in conformity with this standard. The holder/seller shall be responsible for</b></p>	In line with the standard layout

		<b>observing such conformity.</b>	
1. Definition of produce	Green garlic with undeveloped cloves and garlic for industrial processing are excluded.	Green garlic with <b>full leaves and</b> undeveloped cloves and garlic for industrial processing being excluded	Clarification for "green garlic"
1. Definition of produce	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Fresh garlic: produce with a fresh stem, soft and flexible outer skin of the bulb;</li> <li>• Semi-dry garlic: fresh produce with the stem and incompletely dry outer skin of the bulb;</li> <li>• Dry garlic: fresh produce in which the stem, outer skin of the bulb and the skin surround each clove are completely dry; and</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Fresh garlic: produce with a fresh stem <b>and with the outer skin of the bulb</b> soft and flexible <del>outer skin of the bulb</del>;</li> <li>• Semi-dry garlic: fresh produce with the stem <b>and outer skin of the bulb not completely dry</b> <del>incompletely dry outer skin of the bulb</del>;</li> <li>• Dry garlic: fresh produce in which the stem, outer skin of the bulb and the skin surround each clove are completely dry; and</li> </ul>	Clarification
2.1 Minimum Requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• practically free of pests and damage caused by them affecting the general appearance of the produce;</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• practically free of pests;</li> <li>• <b>practically free</b> of damage caused by pests <del>affecting the general appearance of the produce</del>;</li> </ul>	Clarification in line with standard layout.
2.1 Minimum Requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• free of any foreign smell and/or taste<sup>1</sup></li> </ul> <p><sup>1</sup> This provision does not apply to smoked garlic, and smoked garlic must be labelled accordingly.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>free of any foreign smell and/or taste<sup>1</sup></li> </ul> <p><sup>1</sup> This provision does not <del>apply to smoked garlic, and smoked garlic must be labelled accordingly</del> <b>preclude a specific smell and/or specific taste for garlic dried by smoking in countries or regions where smoked garlic is considered as a fresh vegetable.</b></p>	<p>There is no category named "smoked garlic". This footnote is a derogation for products covered by the standard: the semi-dry and dry garlic that have been dried by smoking.</p> <p>Foreign smell and taste, other than smoke, must also be excluded for garlic dried by smoking.</p> <p>The labelling requirement must be present in the appropriate chapter (see below point 6.1.1 and 6.2.2)</p>
2.2.3 Class II	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• slight tears on the external skin or missing</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <del>slight</del> tears on the external skin or missing</li> </ul>	Slight tears are accepted already in Class I, tears

	parts of the outer skin of the bulb not exceeding the half of the surface;	parts of the outer skin of the bulb not exceeding the half of the surface;	should be accepted in Class II, considering that missing part of the outer skin is also accepted
2.2.3 Class II	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>slight staining on the outer skin not exceeding more than half of the bulb surface;</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><del>slight</del> staining on the outer skin not exceeding more than half of the bulb surface;</li> </ul>	“Slight” staining is allowed within the tolerance for Class I. To be consistent, in Class II “slight” should be deleted and “staining” allowed.
2.2.3 Class II	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>no more than two damaged cloves;</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><del>no more than two damaged cloves;</del></li> </ul>	<p>This defect is not accepted as the term “damage” may comprise</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>mechanical damage, which should be covered by “healed injuries” and/or</li> <li>physiological damages (which would be internal damages)</li> </ul> <p>Trade and consumers are not willing to accept internal damages.</p>
3 Provisions concerning sizing		<p>New provisions on minimum size:</p> <p><b><u>When determined by the maximum diameter of the equatorial section the minimum size shall be:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b><u>45 mm for "Extra" Class</u></b></li> <li><b><u>30 mm for Classes I and II.</u></b></li> </ul> <p><b><u>For bulbs not sized by diameter, the minimum size shall be consistent with the minimum diameter indicated above.</u></b></p>	Provisions on minimum size should be developed.
		<p>New provisions on uniformity:</p> <p><b><u>When determined by the maximum diameter of the equatorial section, to ensure</u></b></p>	Provisions on uniformity should be developed.

		<p><b><u>uniformity in size, the range in size between produce in the same package shall not exceed:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b><u>15 mm when the smallest bulb has a diameter of less than 40 mm</u></b></li> <li>• <b><u>20 mm when the smallest bulb has a diameter equal to or more than 40 mm.</u></b></li> </ul> <p><b><u>To ensure uniformity in size for bulbs not sized by diameter, the difference in size shall be consistent with the difference indicated above.</u></b></p>	
4.1.1 "Extra" Class	Five percent by number or weight of bulbs not satisfying the requirements of the class, but meeting those of Class I. Within this tolerance not more than 1% in total may consist of produce satisfying the requirements of Class II.	Five percent by number or weight of bulbs not satisfying the requirements of the class, but meeting those of Class I. Within this tolerance not more than $\pm$ <b><u>0.5</u></b> % in total may consist of produce satisfying the requirements of Class II.	Necessity to keep the exceptional nature of products classified in "Extra" Class. In line with the UNECE standard.
4.1.2 Class I	In addition, not more than 1% by weight of bulbs may have cloves with externally visible sprouts.	In addition, not more than 1% by <b><u>number or</u></b> weight of bulbs may have cloves with externally visible sprouts.	As for all other tolerances, the percentage may refer to weight or number
4.1.2 Class I		New paragraph: <b><u>In addition to this tolerance, not more than 25 % by number or weight, of bulbs showing slight staining on the outer skin of the bulb, provided it does not cover more than a quarter of the bulb surface.</u></b>	Slight stain is a defect that normally happens since garlic grows directly in the soil, and often is dried in the orchard once harvested. A higher tolerance for visual defect should be acceptable.
4.1.3 Class II	In addition, not more than 5% by weight of	In addition, not more than 5% by <b><u>number or</u></b>	As for all other tolerances, the percentage may refer to

	bulbs may have cloves with externally visible sprouts.	weight of bulbs may have cloves with externally visible sprouts.	weight or number
4.2 Size tolerances	For all classes, ten percent by number or weight of bulbs not corresponding to the size indicated on the package.	For all classes; ten percent by number or weight of bulbs not corresponding to the size indicated on the package <b><u>or not satisfying the requirements as regards sizing.</u></b>	Tolerance should also exist for minimum size and uniformity
6.1.1 Nature of produce	If the produce is not visible from the outside, each package shall be labelled as to the name of the produce (“garlic” and/or “fresh garlic”, “semi-dry garlic”, “dry garlic” or “solo garlic”) and the name of the variety.	If the produce is not visible from the outside, each package shall be labelled as to the name of the produce (“garlic” and/or “fresh garlic”, “semi-dry garlic”, “dry garlic” or “solo garlic”) <del>and the name of the variety.</del> <b><u>Name of the variety and/or commercial type (optional).</u></b>	Information of the name of the variety is not essential but consumer may be informed about the variety and/or the commercial type.
		New paragraph: <b><u>"Smoked", where appropriate.</u></b>	Consumer should be informed when garlic has been dried by smoking.
6.2.2 Nature of produce		1 new paragraph: <b><u>"Smoked", where appropriate.</u></b>	Garlic dried by smoking. have particular characteristics and this should be mentioned
6.2.4 Commercial Identification	- size expressed as minimum and maximum diameters of the bulb or size code;	- <b><u>if sized</u></b> , size expressed as minimum and maximum diameters of the bulb or size code;	Sizing of garlic is optional

## Specific comments on the draft standard for kiwifruit

Paragraph and section number	Original text	Proposed text	Reason for the change/inclusion
3.1 Minimum requirements	- adequately firm;	- adequately firm; <b><u>not soft, shrivelled or water-soaked</u></b> -	Indent on firmness should be further clarified. The term "adequately" is subjective.
3.2 Maturity requirements	The fruit at harvest and/or packing must have attained a degree of maturity of at least 6.2° Brix or an average dry matter content of 15%.	The fruit at harvest and/or packing must have attained a degree of maturity of at least 6.2° Brix or an average dry matter content of 15%, <b><u>which should lead to a minimum of 9.5° Brix when entering the distribution chain.</u></b>	A kiwifruit with 6.2° is not mature enough for consumption; the standard should need to ensure that the Brix level will continue to increase; this is not a requirement for retail.
4. Provisions concerning sizing	For <i>A. chinensis</i> and <i>A. deliciosa</i> specifically, the minimum weight for "Extra" Class is 90 g, for Class I is 70 g and for Class II is 65 g.	<del>For <i>A. chinensis</i> and <i>A. deliciosa</i> specifically.</del> ‡The minimum weight for "Extra" Class is 90 g, for Class I is 70 g and for Class II is 65 g.	Hybrids of <i>A. chinensis</i> and <i>A. deliciosa</i> should also be subject to the minimum weight or all kiwi should be exempted from this requirement
5.1.1 "Extra" Class	Five percent, by number or weight, of kiwifruit not satisfying the requirements of the class but meeting those of Class I. [Included therein is 1% tolerance for decay, soft rot and/or internal breakdown.]	Five percent, by number or weight, of kiwifruit not satisfying the requirements of the class but meeting those of Class I. <b><u>Within this tolerance not more than 0.5 per cent in total may consist of produce satisfying the requirements of Class II quality. Included therein is 1% tolerance for decay, soft rot and/or internal breakdown.</u></b>	"Extra" Class should remain extra. The products classified "extra" must be of an exceptional nature. This will allow fair competition between producers who make an effort to increase the value of their production.  Most of the Codex standards do not have tolerances for decay, even in class II, some standards provide that produce affected by rotting or any other deterioration rendering it unfit for consumption are excluded. There is no reason to have a specific tolerance for kiwifruit.

			Among Codex standards for fresh fruit and vegetables, only the standard for apples includes a tolerance for decay in Extra Class. Unless there is an acceptable justification for introducing a percentage for tolerance for decay, soft rot and/or internal breakdown for kiwifruit, it should not be included.
5.1.2 Class I	Ten percent, by number or weight, of kiwifruit not satisfying the requirements of the class but meeting those of Class II. Included therein is [2%] tolerance for decay, soft rot and/or internal breakdown.	Ten percent, by number or weight, of kiwifruit not satisfying the requirements of the class but meeting those of Class II. Included therein is <del>2</del> <b>1</b> % tolerance <b><u>of kiwifruit not satisfying the requirement of Class II quality, nor the minimum requirement, or of kiwifruit affected by</u></b> for decay, soft rot and/or internal breakdown.	Tolerance for decay, soft rot and/or internal breakdown should be allowed cautiously. 1 % for Class I is enough, it should be different from the 2 % tolerance for Class II.  Decay is progressive and a 1 % of decay at export may lead to a 5 % of decay at destination.  It is necessary to have clear distinction between the classes described in Codex commodity standards for them to be truly meaningful. Allowing for the same tolerance for decay (1%) in both Class I and Class II clearly does not achieve this aim.  As for other standards, 1 % tolerance for produce not satisfying Class II or minimum requirement should also be allowed in Class I
5.1.3 Class II	Ten percent by number or weight of kiwifruit satisfying neither the requirements of the class nor the minimum requirements, with the exception of produce affected by decay should not be more	Ten percent by number or weight of kiwifruit satisfying neither the requirements of the class nor the minimum requirements, <b><u>Included therein, not more than 2 % in total may consist</u></b> <del>with the exception</del> of produce affected by	Clarification, same wording as the ones for Class I and Extra Class

	than 2%.	decay, <b><u>soft rot and/or internal breakdown</u></b> <del>should not be more than 2%.</del>	
6.2 Packaging		New sentence <b><u>Stickers individually affixed to the produce shall be such that, when removed, they neither leave visible traces of glue nor lead to skin defects.</u></b>	This type of provisions is used in UNECE standards and it is particularly relevant for kiwifruit.