



**EUROPEAN COMMISSION**

HEALTH & CONSUMER PROTECTION DIRECTORATE-GENERAL

Directorate C - Scientific Opinions

**C2 - Management of scientific committees ; scientific co-operation and networks**

**SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE ON PLANTS**

**SCP/REPT/036-Final**

**17 January 2003**

**MINUTES OF THE 36<sup>th</sup> MEETING  
OF THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE ON PLANTS  
BRUSSELS, 17 December 2002**

## **ATTENDANCE LIST**

### **Members**

Dr. M-P. DELCOUR-FIRQUET  
Prof. A. R. HARDY (Chairman)  
Prof. S. O. KARENLAMPI  
Mr. H. KOEPP  
Prof. A. LESZKOWICZ  
Prof. M. MARONI (Vice-Chairman)  
Dr. O. MEYER  
Prof. E. PAPADOPOULOU  
Prof. E. PETZINGER  
Prof. K. SAVOLAINEN  
Prof. J. SCHIEMANN  
Prof. A. M. S. SILVA FERNANDES  
Dr. G. SPEIJERS

### **Apologies**

Dr. A. MORETTO  
Prof. F. O' GARA (Vice-Chairman)  
Prof. H. V. DAVIES  
Dr. H. A. KUIPER

### **Commission**

Mr. W. MAIER DG Health and Consumer Protection E1  
Ms. A. KLAUK DG Environment C3

### **Secretariat**

Mr. M. WALSH DG Health and Consumer Protection, C2  
Ms. M. DUNIER-THOMANN DG Health and Consumer Protection C2

**1. Welcome and apologies**

The Chairman, Prof. Hardy opened the meeting and welcomed the members.

**2. Adoption of the agenda**

The agenda was adopted (Document SCP/AGENDA/036).

**3. Declaration of interests by Members**

None.

**4. Adoption of the minutes**

**4.1 Adoption of the minutes of the 35<sup>th</sup> Plenary Meeting SCP (23 October 2002)**

The draft minutes were approved after minor amendments and are available as Document SCP/REPT/035-Final at:

[http://europa.eu.int/comm/food/fs/sc/scp/out137\\_en.pdf](http://europa.eu.int/comm/food/fs/sc/scp/out137_en.pdf)

**4.2 Matters arising**

None

**5. Adoption of opinions**

**5.1 Draft opinion on additional questions from the Commission concerning the evaluation of fenthion**

**The Committee was asked to respond to the following two questions:**

1. Can the Committee comment on the relevance of the new data and arguments related to the risk assessment to birds presented by the Rapporteur Member State regarding the intended uses (bait use in citrus and olive orchards, 75 g a.s./ha)
2. Considering the intended uses (bait uses in citrus and olive groves) does the Committee consider that the additional toxicological information alters its previous assessment?

In the opinion on the question 1 the Committee points out that the risk to birds from the bait application of fenthion are very uncertain and the concern expressed in the Committee's first opinion remains unresolved in spite of the new field data. The only available field study for the bait application of fenthion to olives presents limitations regarding the magnitude of the reduction in residues compared to full application. The data provided for olives cannot be used in the citrus assessment. The Committee would recommend to monitoring residues and mortality in a larger number of field sites.

In the opinion on the question 2 the Committee points out that the new toxicological data does not alter the previous conclusion regarding the mutagenic properties of the fenthion and the risk of delayed neurotoxicity is unlikely.

The Committee adopted the opinion, which is available as SCP/FENTHION-BIS/002-  
[http://europa.eu.int/comm/food/fs/sc/scp/out140\\_ppp\\_en.pdf](http://europa.eu.int/comm/food/fs/sc/scp/out140_ppp_en.pdf)

## **5.2 Draft opinion on the draft guidance document on relevant metabolites**

The Commission services explained that the draft guidance document on relevant metabolites (SANCO/221/200-rev 7b) is particularly difficult to finalise because of the sensitive issue of the protection of groundwater (the first draft was distributed in November 1999). The SCP has issued a first opinion<sup>1</sup> on the 30 November 2000 on an earlier version of the draft guidance document (rev 2). Following the publication of the SCP's opinion, the draft guidance document had been revised by the Commission services. The SCP was then requested to give a second opinion on the revised document and respond to 3 questions:

What is the Committee's opinion with regard to the overall level of protection for consumers, which is achieved by the proposed approach?

Could the Committee comment on the appropriateness of the proposed cut-off limit to all non-relevant metabolites in groundwater?

Can the Committee comment on the introductory remarks for "Step 4" and provide its opinion about the alternative approach proposed by Germany (see comments)?

The Committee pointed out in the opinion on question 1 that in the draft rev 7b the discussions are not purely based on toxicological reasons. The cut-off limit of 0.1 µg/l lacks a toxicological justification in term of protection of human health.

In the opinion on question 2 the Committee also concluded that the limit of 10 µg/l for all substances in groundwater has not a toxicological justification.

In the opinion on question 3 the Committee recommends the use of 2 litre/day for the water consumption of the population as conventionally used by the WHO and international bodies.

The Committee adopted the opinion, which is available as SCP/GUIDE-METAB-bis/002 Final at: [http://europa.eu.int/comm/food/fs/sc/scp/out139\\_ppp\\_en.pdf](http://europa.eu.int/comm/food/fs/sc/scp/out139_ppp_en.pdf)

## **5.3 Draft opinion on the guidance document on FOCUS surface water scenarios**

The Committee supports the overall conclusions and recommendations contained in the draft guidance document of the Surface Water Scenarios Workgroup of FOCUS (FORum for the Co-ordination of pesticide fate models and their USE), "FOCUS surface water scenarios in the EU Evaluation Process under 91/414/EEC" (June 2002), and supports the stepped assessment approach. The Commission services explained that the experts of the WG FOCUS surface water would meet again in January to amend the guidance document draft according to SCP opinion.

Committee adopted the opinion, which is available as SCP/GUIDE-FOC-SW/002- Final at: [http://europa.eu.int/comm/food/fs/sc/scp/out138\\_ppp\\_en.pdf](http://europa.eu.int/comm/food/fs/sc/scp/out138_ppp_en.pdf)

---

<sup>1</sup> [http://europa.eu.int/comm/food/fs/sc/scp/out82\\_ppp\\_en.html](http://europa.eu.int/comm/food/fs/sc/scp/out82_ppp_en.html)

## **6. Progress Report on dossiers referred to the Scientific Committee on Plants**

### **6.1 Opinion on the guidance document on environmental risk assessments of active substances used on rice**

The Chairman informed the Committee that the draft opinion will be examined at the next WG Environment on 21 January 2003 and should be adopted at the next SCP plenary on 30 January 2003.

### **6.2 Opinion on atrazine and simazine**

The draft opinions will be examined at the next WG Env on 21 January 2002 and the Committee should adopt them at the SCP plenary on 30 January 2003.

### **6.3 Opinion on isoxaflutole**

The draft opinion will be examined at the next WG Env on 21 January for question 2 and at the next WG Tox on 29 January 2003 for question 1. The Committee should adopt the opinion at the SCP plenary on 30 January 2003.

### **6.4 Uniform principle (Annex VI B) on micro-organisms**

The Chairman informed the Committee that the amended draft working document establishing Annex VI B to Council Directive 91/414 (SANCO/108/2002 14.01.2002) which was circulated, should be accompanied by short overview prepared by the Committee with the amended text as an annex. It was decided to have it on the agenda of the next working groups in January 2003 with possible adoption envisaged at SCP plenary on 30 January 2003.

## **7. Progress report on GMO guidance document on risk assessment**

The secretariat gave an update on the activities of the Joint Working Group on Genetically Modified Organisms/ Novel Food/ Novel Feed of the SCP/SCF/SCAN on the "Guidance document on the information needed for the risk assessment of genetically modified plants and derived food and feed". During the last meeting of the WG the revised guidance document was finalised and can be forwarded to the Steering Committee to be placed on the agenda of its plenary meeting of 16&17 January 2003.

## **8. Other business**

### **8.1 Information on 2003 Workshops**

W. Maier (DG SANCO) informed the Committee on an international workshop on "Investigating probabilistic methods to assess worker exposure to agricultural pesticides" organised by ILSI Risk Science Institute foreseen at end of September 2003 (somewhere in Europe) to develop concepts and case studies. DG SANCO is one of the sponsor (30 000 Euro) with Health Canada, US EPA, ILSI Risk Science Institute, ECPA,.... As

European toxicologists are expected to be a minority, they are encouraged to participate in the workgroups.

The Chairman informed the Committee that DG RDT will fund (accompanying measure in key action 1 in the Quality of Life programme of the 5<sup>th</sup> framework programme) an European Workshop on the interface between risk assessment and risk management, possibly on March or September 2003 in the Netherlands (Noordwijkerhout near Amsterdam). About 30 persons will attend (scientists, decision-makers from member states, industry), they will work on a case study and will analyse recent opinions emitted by the SCP. A. Hart (UK) will be the organiser and the contact point.

## **8.2 Experts needed for the panels of the 6<sup>th</sup> framework programme in DG Research**

W. Maier reported that DG RTD is desperately looking for experts as toxicologists and health specialists, environmentalists for the evaluation panels for the first call for tender in the 6<sup>th</sup> framework programme (launched on 17 December 2002), he also asked to participants to advertise in their laboratories. The desk officer to contact is R. Hardwick and the information is on the CORDIS web side.

## **8.3 European Food Safety Authority**

P. Wagstaffe (Head of Unit DG SANCO C2) informed the Committee on the progress in the EFSA. The Management Board decided that the call for declaration of interest for experts of the future scientific panels would be launched in January for about a 2 months period. The new Scientific Panels including the one on “Plant health, plant protection products and their residues” could start working after mid-May 2003. Consequently the pending work of the SCP should be finished as soon as possible.

## **9. Future Meetings**

WG Tox : 29 January 2003 and WG Env : 21 January 2003.

Next plenary: 30 January 2003, possibly 20 March 2003 if needed.