

# **Minutes of the Nineteenth Meeting of the Scientific Committee on Plants - Brussels, 17 March 2000**

## ***ATTENDANCE LIST***

### ***Members***

Prof. H. V. DAVIES, Dr. M.-P. DELCOUR-FIRQUET, Dr. R. HANS, Prof. A. R. HARDY (Chairman), Prof. S. O. KARENLAMPI, Mr H. KOEPP, Dr. H. A. KUIPER, Prof. M. MARONI (Vice-Chairman), Dr. O. MEYER, Prof. A. MORETTO, Prof. F O' GARA (Vice-Chairman), Prof. K. SAVOLAINEN, Dr. T. SHERRATT, Dr. G. SPEIJERS

### ***Apologies***

Dr. J. J. LEGUAY, Dr. H. G. NOLTING, Prof. A. M. S. SILVA FERNANDES

### ***Invited Experts***

#### ***Commission***

Mr W. MAIER - Health and Consumer Protection E1, Ms A. SZKLANNa- Health and Consumer Protection E1, Mr V. MATZEIET - Environment E1, Ms B. JENSEN - Environment E1

#### ***Secretariat***

Mr M. WALSH Health and Consumer Protection, B2, Ms S. VAN IMPE Health and Consumer Protection, B2

## **1. Welcome, Apologies and Introductory Remarks**

The Chairman, Professor A. Hardy opened the meeting and welcomed the members.

## **2. Adoption of the agenda**

The agenda was adopted (Doc. [SCP/AGENDA/019-Rev. 2](#))

## **3. Declaration of interests by Members**

All members present confirmed that they had no conflict of interests to report relative to the items for discussion.

## **4. Adoption of the minutes of the Seventeenth Plenary Meeting and matters arising (28 January 2000)**

### **4.1 Adoption of the minutes of the Eighteenth Plenary Meeting**

The draft minutes were approved and are available as [Document SCP/REPT/018-Final](#).

### **4.2 Matters arising**

None.

## **5. Progress report (including possible adoption of certain opinions) on the following plant protection product dossiers referred to the Scientific Committee on Plants**

### **5.1 Esfenvalerate**

Following an exchange of views the Committee adopted the opinion which is available as [Document SCP/ESFEN/002- FINAL](#)

In its opinion the Committee dealt with questions on carcinogenicity, dermal absorption, dietary risk assessment and risk to aquatic organisms and non-target arthropods including honey bees.

### **5.2 Diquat**

Following an exchange of views the Committee adopted the opinion which is available as Document SCP/DIQUAT/002-FINAL

In its opinion the Committee dealt with questions on bird reproduction, possible long term effects due to slow degradation in soil, ecotoxicological acceptability of aquatic uses, operator exposure for amateur users and dietary risk assessment.

### **5.3 Metsulfuron-methyl**

Following an exchange of views the Committee adopted the opinion which is available as Document SCP/METSU/002-FINAL

The opinion deals with the following questions: In its opinion the Committee dealt with questions on risk to ground water and non-target aquatic organisms.

### **5.4 Triasulfuron**

Following an exchange of views the Committee adopted the opinion which is available as [Document SCP/TRIA/002-FINAL](#)

The opinion deals with the following questions: In its opinion the Committee dealt with questions on risk to ground water and non-target aquatic organisms.

### **5.5 Flupyr sulfuron-methyl**

The Chairman reported that the Environmental WG met on 25 February and had examined the clarifications received from the notifier. It had been noted that a conflict exists between two studies provided by the notifier with regard to the quantity of soil metabolite IN-KC 576. The Committee decided to request the Toxicological WG to review the toxicology of the metabolite in order to facilitate a decision on its relevance. G. Speijers was appointed rapporteur and will report to the next meeting of the Toxicology WG on 4 May. In the circumstances the Committee deferred adoption of the opinion.

### **5.6 Vinclozolin**

Following an exchange of views the Committee adopted the opinion which is available as Document SCP/VINCLO/021-FINAL.

This second opinion (first opinion <sup>1</sup>) of the SCP on vinclozolin deals with toxicity to birds and the risk to birds and wild mammals.

## **6. Progress reports on the following plant protection product dossiers referred to the Scientific Committee on Plants**

### **6.1 Ampelomyces quiqualis**

### **6.2 Pseudomonas chlororaphis**

### **6.3 Paecilomyces fumosoroseus**

The Committee agreed the composition of the ad hoc WG as proposed by F O' Gara and M. Maroni which is as follows: F O' Gara (Chairman), and other SCP Members: M. Maroni, M.-P. Delcour, O. Meyer, G. Speijers, SCAN Members: A. Chesson , A. von Wright and invited experts: C. Alabouvette, G. Defago, M. R. Gismondo, M. Nutti, D. Stead and M. van Bruggen. Professor O' Gara reported that the first meeting of the WG would take place on 28 March.

### **6.4 Prohexadione calcium**

This new active substance had been referred to the Committee without a specific question(s). The Committee had agreed a procedure for dealing with such cases which is outlined under item 4.2 of the minutes of the Seventeenth Plenary Report <sup>2</sup>. In such cases, the relevant review documentation would be submitted to the Committee for information and the period between meetings allowed for the Committee to react. Prohexadione calcium had been submitted to the Committee at its last meeting of 28 January 2000. The Committee reiterated its earlier statements that absence of comment should only be interpreted as an indication of no obvious reasons necessitating comment.

Following an exchange of views the Committee decided that there were no issues that it wished to raise regarding the active substance in the context of a possible inclusion in Annex 1 to Directive 91/414/EEC <sup>3</sup>. It was recognised that national authorisations would involve specific risk management in line with Annex VI <sup>4</sup> (Uniform Principles) of Directive 91/414/EEC.

### **6.5 Ethoxysulfuron**

M. Maroni, Chairman of the WG Toxicology reported that the question on carcinogenicity had been examined at the WG meeting of 5 March 2000. P. Wester had been appointed Rapporteur. The draft opinion would be examined at the WG Toxicology (carcinogenicity) on 23 May. The intention was to submit a draft opinion for adoption at the Plenary Meeting of 6 June.

### **6.6 Sulfosulfuron**

M. Maroni, Chairman of the WG Toxicology reported that the question on carcinogenicity had been examined at the WG meeting of 5 March 2000. A. Moretto had been appointed Rapporteur. The draft opinion would be examined at the WG Toxicology (carcinogenicity) on 23 May. The intention is to submit a draft opinion for adoption at the Plenary Meeting of 6 June.

### **6.7 Carfentrazone ethyl**

M. Maroni reported that a draft opinion prepared by MP Delcour had been examined at the WG Toxicology of 16 March. The draft will be re-examined at the WG Toxicology of 4 May and the intention is to submit a draft opinion for adoption at the Plenary Meeting of 6 June.

### **6.8 Pyridate**

M. Maroni reported that a first draft opinion will be prepared by the joint rapporteurs A. Fait and M. Maroni.

### **6.9 Amitrole**

M. Maroni reported that a draft opinion (Question 2) prepared by A. Moretto had been examined at the WG Toxicology (carcinogenicity) of 5 March. Dr Moretto and Professor Parry had been asked to re-examine the mutagenicity data. A revised draft will be examined at the WG Toxicology meeting of 4 May.

M. Maroni reported that the question on operator exposure would be deferred pending clarification of the carcinogenic status of the active substance.

### **6.10 Warfarin**

M. Maroni reported that a first draft opinion as prepared by A. Moretto had been examined at the WG Toxicology of 16 March. A revised text will be examined at the WG Toxicology of 4 May with a view to the adoption of an opinion on 5 May.

## **7. Progress report and exchange of views on plant GMO dossiers**

### **7.1. Starch potato from Amylogene (Notification C/SE/96/3501)**

The Secretariat reported that the Commission services had decided to refer the question to the Notifier as agreed at the SCP Plenary of 2 December 1999. The question was transmitted to the Notifier on 6 March and concerned certain molecular biology aspects considered necessary to carry out the risk assessment.

### **7.2 Oilseed rape from Hoechst Schering AgrEvo GmbH with tolerance to glufosinate ammonium (Notification C/DE/98/6)**

The Secretariat reported that there was no progress to report on the clarifications it sought on 28 October from the Notifier. The Committee had received responses on 27 January 2000 to three of the five questions it had raised. The Secretariat undertook to write to the Notifier regard the likely date for the response to the two remaining questions.

### **7.3 Genetically modified insect tolerant (Bt-11) maize from Novartis Seeds SA (Notification C/F/96/05-10).**

The Secretariat confirmed that the questions of clarification agreed at the previous meeting had now been agreed by written procedure. The questions will be transmitted shortly to the Notifier and concerned substantial equivalence of the modified plants.

### **7.4 Conventionally derived crosses between approved genetically modified maize lines T25 and MON810 from Pioneer Overseas Corp. (Notification C/NL/98/08).**

F O' Gara, Chairman of the GMO WG reported that the Notifier had provided the clarifications sought by the Committee at its previous meeting. These data had been examined and found satisfactory by the GMO WG at its meeting of 16 March. He reported that it is the intention to adopt the opinion at the Plenary Meeting of 5 May.

### **7.5 Genetically modified maize (*Zea mays*) line GA21, with tolerance to glyphosate herbicide from Monsanto (Notification C/ES/98/01)**

F O' Gara reported that the Notifier had responded to the two questions raised at the Plenary Meeting of 28 January. The Committee decided to reject the pooled data on substantial equivalence and to request the Notifier to provide the data on a site-by-site basis. The Notifier had been unable to supply the requested molecular biology data due to confidentiality issues. The Committee decided that these data would be essential for a full risk assessment to be carried out and in the circumstances requested the Secretariat to take the necessary steps, as provided under Directive 90/220/EEC, to obtain access to the data.

## **8. Exchange of views on the White Paper on Food Safety**

The Committee exchanged views on the White Paper on the basis of a working document prepared by the Chairman. Following an exchange of views the Chairman agreed to review his document in the light of comments made by members. It is intended to submit a document to the Commission before the end of April.

## **9. Other business**

### **Date of next meeting:**

The next meeting of the Committee will take place on 6 May 2000.

-----

<sup>1</sup> **First Opinion SCP/VINCL0/019-final of 28 October 1999**  
([http://ec.europa.eu/food/sites/food/files/safety/docs/sci-com\\_scp\\_out52\\_en.pdf](http://ec.europa.eu/food/sites/food/files/safety/docs/sci-com_scp_out52_en.pdf))

<sup>2</sup> [http://ec.europa.eu/food/sites/food/files/safety/docs/sci-com\\_scp\\_out57\\_en.pdf](http://ec.europa.eu/food/sites/food/files/safety/docs/sci-com_scp_out57_en.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> OJ No L 230, 09.08.1991, p.1., as corrected in OJ NoL 170, 25.6.1992, p.40

<sup>4</sup> OJ No L 265, 27.09.1997, p.87.