

Minutes of the seventh meeting of the Scientific Committee on Plants, Brussels, 14 July 1998

ATTENDANCE LIST

Members

Prof. H. V. DAVIES, Prof. F. FUHR, Dr. R. HANS, Prof. A. R. HARDY, Prof. S. O. KARENLAMPI, Dr. H. A. KUIPER, Dr. J. J. LEGUAY, Prof. M. MARONI (Vice-Chairman), Prof. F O' GARA, (Vice-Chairman), Dr. E. RODRIGUEZ-CEREZO, Prof. A. M. S. SILVA FERNANDES (Chairman)

Apologies

Dr. M.-P. DELCOUR-FIRQUET, Dr. H. G. NOLTING

Invited

Dr. H. KOEPP, Dr. G. SPEIJERS, Dr. L.A. AUMAITRE

Commission

Mr C. F. HINSLEY (DG VI/B/2.1), Mr C. EDMUNDS (DG VI/B/2.1), Mr. D. BOSWORTH (DG XI/E/2), Mr M. ZETTERSTRAND (DG XI/E/2), Mr G. VAN DEN EEDE (JCR), Mrs J. VERGNETTES (DG XXIV/B/1), Mrs M. DE SOLA (DG XXIV/B/2)

Secretariat

Mr M. WALSH (DG XXIV/B/2), Ms S. VAN IMPE (DG XXIV/B/2)

1. Welcome, Apologies and Introductory Remarks

The Chairman welcomed the members to the meeting and noted the apologies (see attendance list).

2. Adoption of the agenda

The agenda was adopted (Doc. SCP/AGENDA/007-Rev. 1)

3. Declaration of interests by Members

All members present confirmed that they had no conflict of interests to report relative to the items for discussion.

4. Adoption of the minutes of the Sixth Plenary Meeting (23 June 1998)

The draft minutes were approved with some minor textual amendments. The report is available as Document No. SCP/REPT/006-Final of 14 July 1998.

5. Plant Protection Products - Active Substances Kresoxim-Methyl, Fenthion and Isoxaflutole

5.1. Kresoxim-methyl - Exchange of views and adoption of draft opinion

Following an exchange of views and some proposals for minor amendments, the opinion was adopted. It is available as Document SCP/KRESOX/008-Final

5.2. Fenthion

The Committee agreed on the substance of the report - a finalised version will be prepared with a view to adoption at the October Plenary.

5.3. Isoxaflutole - Meeting schedule

Environmental aspects - WG scheduled for 23 September 1998 under the chairmanship of A. Hardy and members will include A. Silva Fernandes, H_G Nolting and invited experts A. Carter, V. Forbes and J. Boesten.

Carcinogenicity - meeting took place on 23 June report awaited.

Development - WGs scheduled for 30 July.

6. Pesticides Residues

6.1 Adoption of opinion on the questions raised to the SCP on pesticide residues in foods for infants and young children

The Committee reviewed the two draft opinions which had been prepared by the residue WG which had met on 7 July. The draft opinions were as follows:

1. Opinion of the scientific committee on plants regarding variable pesticide residues in fruit and vegetables;
2. Opinion of the scientific committee on plants regarding questions relating to amending the annexes to Council Directives 86/362/EEC, 86/363/EEC and 90/642/EEC.

R. Hans, Chairperson of the WG outlined the content of the first report, drawing the Committee's attention to the six recommendations contained in the report. M. Maroni indicated that he could not support the opinion as the Committee had not discussed the scientific implications of the procedure to be used for setting maximum residue levels (Acute Reference Dose - ArfD) but had accepted the methodology recommended by a Joint FAO/WHO consultation held in 1997. He indicated that it was his opinion that such a methodology could not be accepted and implemented by the SCP without a proper evaluation and discussion. Accordingly, he did not support the adoption of the opinion.

In the case of the second opinion, M. Maroni objected to the use of the German and UK models for dietary risk assessment as he maintained that they had not been discussed at Community level although this point was disputed. He also questioned the appropriateness of a 21-day oral study as the basis for an acute dietary risk assessment when more appropriate data exist. He issued minority opinion to be included in the SCP's opinion.

The Committee decided to adopt both opinions by written procedure in order to allow members the opportunity to study further the two opinions. As no comments had been received by the deadline of 27 July, the two opinions were adopted by majority.

6.2 SCP opinion on pesticide residues in manufactured food intended for infants and young children

In addition to the question referred to the SCF, a question was addressed to the SCP at its plenary meeting of 18-19 May 1998 (see report item of meeting report). Following an exchange of views, it was apparent that little available data exists.

F Fuhr agreed to prepare a draft opinion for examination at the October Plenary meeting.

M Maroni expressed concern at the approach taken by the SCF to pesticide residues in babyfood, stating that he was of the opinion that the approach used supported a quality standard. He also maintained that the involvement of the SCP in the preparation of the opinion was insufficient.

7. Antimicrobial Working Group

The SCP had nominated a member to the WG at its Plenary Meeting of 18-19 May 1998. As the nominee was not a member of the SCP but of the SC Animal Nutrition (SCAN) and that Committee was already represented by a member, it was felt that participation of a member of the SCP would be more appropriate - in the circumstance Dr von Wright agreed to relinquish his nomination to the WG.

Nominations were sought from the Committee and F O' Gara proposed S Karenlampi: no other nominations were received.

In response, Prof. Karenlampi explained that she has been an ad hoc expert in this area for the Finish Authorities and that in this capacity had defended Finland's viewpoints. Prof. Karenlampi nevertheless indicated that she felt that she could assume the role of representing the SCP in the antimicrobial WG with independence and without conflict of interest.

The Chairman, on behalf of the Committee, thanked Prof. Karenlampi and during a short discussion, the Committee indicated that it was aware of the situation and unanimously elected Prof. Karenlampi as a member to the WG.

8. Genetically Modified Organisms - Plants

8.1. Potato with a change in starch composition notified by AVEBE and forwarded by the Netherlands (C/NL/96/10)

The Committee exchanged views on the question of amikasin resistance, identification of some sequences in the vector and the submitted feeding trials.

The Committee members will review further these questions and consider them at the next plenary meeting.

8.2. Cotton expressing the Bt cry IA (c) gene notified by Monsanto and forwarded by Spain (Notification C/ES/96/02)

Following an exchange of views the Committee adopted its opinion.

8.3 Cotton tolerant to glyphosate notified by Monsanto and forwarded by Spain (C/ES/97/01)

Following an exchange of views the Committee adopted its opinion.

8.4 Male sterile chicory notified by Bejo-Zaden and forwarded by the Netherlands (Notification C/NL/94/25-A)

The committee exchanged views on this opinion and formulated a number of questions for the notifier. The questions relate to the structure of the vector used and information on substantially equivalent.

8.5 Glusfosinate ammonium tolerant swede rape notified by AgrEvo (Notification C/DE/96/5)

Following an exchange of views the Committee adopted its opinion.

9. Other Business

Next Plenary Meeting - 2 October 1998