

## **APPENDIX 3**

# **LITERATURE SEARCH FOR ANNUAL MONITORING ON THE GENERAL SURVEILLANCE OF MON 89788 SOYBEAN IN THE EU**

## Table of Contents

<b>1. INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>2. IDENTIFYING THE REVIEW QUESTION AND PURPOSE FOR UNDERTAKING THE LITERATURE SEARCH.....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>3. SEARCHING FOR/IDENTIFYING RELEVANT STUDIES .....</b>	<b>4</b>
3.1. SEARCH TERMS AND THEIR COMBINATION .....	4
3.2. LIMITS APPLIED.....	7
3.3. LANGUAGE .....	7
3.4. TIME PERIOD .....	7
3.5. REFERENCE STUDY SEARCHES.....	8
3.6. INFORMATION SOURCES .....	15
3.6.1. ELECTRONIC BIBLIOGRAPHIC DATABASES.....	15
3.6.2. RELEVANT KEY ORGANISATIONS .....	16
<b>4. SELECTING STUDIES .....</b>	<b>16</b>
4.1. PROCESS .....	16
4.2. QUALITY ASSURANCE .....	17
4.3. ELIGIBILITY/INCLUSION CRITERIA TO ESTABLISH RELEVANCE .....	17
<b>5. SUMMARISING AND REPORTING THE DATA, AND CONSIDERING THE IMPLICATIONS OF THE FINDINGS.....</b>	<b>17</b>
5.1. SEARCH OUTCOMES .....	17
5.1.1. Outcomes of literature search in electronic bibliographic databases.....	17
5.1.2. Outcomes of literature search in internet pages of relevant key organisations ..	17
5.2. RESULTS OF THE STUDY SELECTION PROCESS FOR ELECTRONIC BIBLIOGRAPHIC DATABASES .....	21
5.3. IMPLICATIONS OF THE RETRIEVED RELEVANT STUDIES FOR THE RISK ASSESSMENT ..	23
<b>6. CONCLUSION .....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>REFERENCES.....</b>	<b>25</b>

## 1. INTRODUCTION

As part of the general surveillance requirements for MON 89788 genetically modified (GM) soybean authorised in the European Union (EU) market under regulation (EC) No 1829/2003, Bayer Agriculture BVBA<sup>1</sup> has actively monitored scientific literature related to MON 89788 soybean, covering the time span between June 2018 and May 2019.

The publications that resulted from this literature search have been analysed in detail according to the relevance to for the risk assessment of this product.

The completeness literature search checklist (EFSA's Annex 2) is provided as **Attachment I**.

## 2. IDENTIFYING THE REVIEW QUESTION AND PURPOSE FOR UNDERTAKING THE LITERATURE SEARCH

This literature search has been conducted to address the review question “Do MON 89788 soybean derived food/feed products and the introduced herbicide tolerance trait have adverse effects on human and animal health and the environment?”

The purpose for undertaking this literature search is to ensure compliance with the 2017 EFSA explanatory note on literature searching for annual post-market environmental monitoring (PMEM) on GM soybean products authorised in the EU under regulation (EC) No 1829/2003 (EFSA, 2017).

Key elements used for the review question are humans, animals, and/or the environment (= population), MON 89788 soybean derived food/feed products and the introduced herbicide tolerance trait (= intervention/exposure), conventional counterpart or non-GM soybean (= comparator), and adverse effect on human and animal health, and the environment (= outcomes). Accordingly, the eligibility criteria for assessing the relevance of studies for inclusion in the literature review are provided in **Table 1**.

---

<sup>1</sup> Hereafter, referenced as Bayer

**Table 1. Eligibility/inclusion criteria to establish the relevance of retrieved studies**

Key elements	Criteria
Population	Humans, animals and the environment (taking into account the scope of the application <i>i.e.</i> authorisation for all uses as any other soybean, but excluding the cultivation of MON 89788 soybean are addressed as general protection goals.
Intervention/exposure	MON 89788 soybean derived food/feed products and the introduced herbicide tolerance trait addressed in the study are identical or similar to those under scientific review by the EFSA.
Comparator	In case of a comparative study that uses the GM plant material as test material, eligible studies must report a non-GM soybean as a comparator.
Outcomes	Adverse effects on human and animal health and the environment are addressed (taking into consideration the scope of the application).
<b>Additional key elements</b>	
Information/ data requirements, including source of studies data	The study potentially contributes to the knowledge of the risk assessment of MON 89788 soybean intended for all uses as any other soybean, but excluding cultivation. Original/primary data are presented in the study.

### 3. SEARCHING FOR/IDENTIFYING RELEVANT STUDIES

The approach used to develop the search strategy follows the lumping method and a wide range of free-text terms to define search terms in accordance with the 2010 EFSA Guidance on application of systematic review methodology to food and feed safety assessments to support decision making (EFSA, 2010) and the 2017 EFSA Explanatory note on literature searching (EFSA, 2017).

#### 3.1. Search terms and their combination

The intervention/exposure key elements were defined and translated into search terms. Based on the key elements of the review question, the search terms, the field and the Boolean operators used to combine them were defined as shown in **Table 2**. These search terms considered possible synonyms, related terms, abbreviations and truncations, old and new as well as lay and scientific terminologies, brand and generic names, and spelling variants. Where available, the search was also adapted to controlled vocabulary (subject indexing). The search terms were designed to give an excellent coverage and retrieve the broadest possible number of articles related to MON 89788 soybean.

**Table 3** shows the translation of the intervention key elements into search terms and, when available, the reference publications used to test the search terms. The table includes lists of search terms that are representative of each key element based on the criteria described above and the free-text terms and spelling variants representative of the indicated search terms. As shown in the table, the free-text terms and spelling variants are used to build the search string in the Web of Science<sup>TM</sup> and EBSCOhost platforms. Where available, controlled vocabularies based on Descriptors which are also representative of the indicated search terms are used to build the search string in EBSCOhost platform. The search terms, free-text terms, controlled vocabularies and the search strings are updated upon identification of a new search term.

**Table 2. List of search terms and Boolean operators used to search for MON 89788 related publications**

Set	Field	Search string	Key elements (Intervention/Exposure)
<b>Web of Science™ platform</b>			
#11	Combination	#10 OR #9 OR #7 <i>DocType=All document types;</i> <i>Language=All languages;</i>	
#10	Topic	(TS=(MON89788 OR "MON 89788")) <i>DocType=All document types;</i> <i>Language=All languages;</i>	Events
#9	Combination	#8 AND (#2 OR #1) <i>DocType=All document types;</i> <i>Language=All languages;</i>	The newly expressed proteins in GM organisms, including soybean
#8	Topic	(TS=(cp4epsps OR "cp4 epsps")) <i>DocType=All document types;</i> <i>Language=All languages;</i>	Newly expressed proteins
#7	Combination	#6 OR #5 <i>DocType=All document types;</i> <i>Language=All languages;</i>	GM soybean displaying the introduced herbicide tolerance trait OR GM soybean with the indicated trade name
#6	Combination	#4 AND #2 AND #1 <i>DocType=All document types;</i> <i>Language=All languages;</i>	GM soybean with the indicated trade name
#5	Combination	#3 AND #2 AND #1 <i>DocType=All document types;</i> <i>Language=All languages;</i>	GM soybean displaying the introduced herbicide tolerance trait
#4	Topic	(TS=(RoundupReady* OR "Roundup Ready" OR RR OR "second generation" OR RR2Y)) <i>DocType=All document types;</i> <i>Language=All languages;</i>	Trade name
#3	Topic	(TS=((TOLERAN* OR RESISTAN* OR PROTEC*) NEAR/5 (GLYPHOSATE OR ROUNDUP))) <i>DocType=All document types;</i> <i>Language=All languages;</i>	Introduced herbicide tolerance trait
#2	Topic	(TS=(soybean* OR soy* OR "Glycine max" OR "G max" OR "soy bean")) <i>DocType=All document types;</i> <i>Language=All languages;</i>	Plant species
#1	Topic	(TS=(GMO* OR LMO* OR GM OR GE OR transgen* OR ((genetic* OR living OR biotech*) NEAR/5 (modif* OR transform* OR manipul* OR improv* OR engineer* OR deriv*)))) <i>DocType=All document types;</i> <i>Language=All languages;</i>	GMO general

Set	Field	Search string	Key elements (Intervention/Exposure)
<b>EBSCOhost platform</b> <i>(All document types and all languages)</i>			
S13	Combination	S9 OR S11 OR S12	
S12	All Text	TX (MON89788 OR "MON 89788")	Events
S11	Combination	S10 AND (S2 OR S1)	The newly expressed proteins in GM organisms, including soybean
S10	All Text	TX (cp4epsps OR "cp4 epsps")	Newly expressed proteins
S9	Combination	S7 OR S8	GM soybean displaying the introduced herbicide tolerance trait OR GM soybean with the indicated trade name
S8	Combination	S1 AND S2 AND S6	GM soybean with the indicated trade name
S7	Combination	S1 AND S2 AND S5	GM soybean displaying the herbicide tolerance trait
S6	All Text	TX (RoundupReady* OR "Roundup Ready" OR RR OR "second generation" OR RR2Y)	Trade name
S5	Combination	S3 AND S4	
S4	Descriptor	DE "glyphosate"	Controlled vocabularies (subject indexes) offered by the database for introduced herbicide tolerance trait
S3	Descriptor	DE "weed control"	
S2	Descriptor	DE "soyabeans"	Controlled vocabularies (subject indexes) offered by the database for plant species. Note that the term ' <i>Glycine max</i> ' is covered by the term 'soyabeans'.
S1	Descriptor	DE "genetic engineering" OR DE "genetic transformation" OR DE "genetically engineered foods" OR DE "genetically engineered organisms"	Controlled vocabularies (subject indexes) offered by the database for GMO general term

### 3.2. Limits applied

An advanced literature search was conducted in the Web of Science<sup>TM</sup> Core collection database using the Web of Science<sup>TM</sup> platform<sup>2</sup> and in the CAB Abstracts<sup>®</sup> database<sup>3</sup> using the EBSCOhost platform<sup>4</sup> (see section 3.6.1). Each platform enables searching in the specified electronic database by making use of pre-defined fields, set combinations based on Boolean operators or a combination of both<sup>5,6</sup>.

The literature search strategy utilises the “Topic” (TS) field in Web of Science<sup>TM</sup> platform and the “TX” field in EBSCOhost platform which have the broadest coverage of search terms and enable comprehensive searching within a record<sup>7,6</sup> (see **Table 2**). In the case of the Web of Science<sup>TM</sup> Core collection database, the “TS” field searches for topic terms in the following fields within a record: Title, Abstracts, Author Keywords and Keywords Plus<sup>®</sup>. The Keywords Plus<sup>®</sup> facility maximises the possibility of retrieving relevant records in the advanced search<sup>8</sup>. In the case of the CAB Abstracts<sup>®</sup> database, the “TX” field searches for the search terms “*within the full text of all articles for your term*”<sup>6</sup>.

In this literature search, the search strategy utilised also the controlled vocabulary (subject indexing) facility offered by the CAB Abstracts<sup>®</sup> database. Accordingly, the search string was refined by using the CAB Thesaurus-Descriptors field, which is assigned by subject specialists to CAB records to represent the content of the source documents. The Descriptor (“DE”) field enables selection of one or more controlled terms from the CAB Thesaurus to add to the search query. More importantly, having a controlled vocabulary allows users to use only one term to search for a concept rather than using lots of terms<sup>9</sup>. The most relevant, broad and controlled search terms in the hierarchy of CAB Thesaurus terms that were listed as preferred terms by CAB for the search query were selected and added to the search string in combination with the “DE” field (see **Table 2**).

### 3.3. Language

The search terms and their combination are established in English; hence, the search is expected to result in a list of articles written in English and/or articles written in other languages with at least a title, abstract or keywords in English. Also, technical terms like proteins names, MON codes, Latin names, ... are common in all languages and therefore, articles in all languages, as specified in **Table 2**, will be retrieved.

### 3.4. Time period

This literature search covered the reporting period from June 2018 until May 2019.

---

<sup>2</sup>[http://apps.webofknowledge.com/UA\\_GeneralSearch\\_input.do?product=UA&SID=X1sK9uHnF5WXHkLGpbw&search\\_mode=GeneralSearch](http://apps.webofknowledge.com/UA_GeneralSearch_input.do?product=UA&SID=X1sK9uHnF5WXHkLGpbw&search_mode=GeneralSearch) - Accessed on 10 October 2019

<sup>3</sup>[http://support.ebsco.com/help/?int=ehost&lang=en&feature\\_id=Databases&TOC\\_ID=Always&SI=0&BU=0&GU=1&PS=0&ver=live&db=.lah](http://support.ebsco.com/help/?int=ehost&lang=en&feature_id=Databases&TOC_ID=Always&SI=0&BU=0&GU=1&PS=0&ver=live&db=.lah) - Accessed on 10 October 2019

<sup>4</sup><https://help.ebsco.com/interfaces/EBSCOhost> - Accessed on 10 October 2019

<sup>5</sup>[http://images.webofknowledge.com/WOKRS5251R3/help/WOS/hp\\_advanced\\_examples.html](http://images.webofknowledge.com/WOKRS5251R3/help/WOS/hp_advanced_examples.html) - Accessed on 10 October 2019

<sup>6</sup>[https://help.ebsco.com/interfaces/EBSCOhost/training\\_promotion/Advanced\\_Searching\\_EBSCOhost\\_Tutorial](https://help.ebsco.com/interfaces/EBSCOhost/training_promotion/Advanced_Searching_EBSCOhost_Tutorial) - Accessed on 10 October 2019

<sup>7</sup>[http://images.webofknowledge.com/WOKRS5251R3/help/WOS/hs\\_advanced\\_fieldtags.html](http://images.webofknowledge.com/WOKRS5251R3/help/WOS/hs_advanced_fieldtags.html) - Accessed on 10 October 2019

<sup>8</sup><http://clarivate.libguides.com/woscc/searchtips> - Accessed on 10 October 2019

<sup>9</sup><https://www.cabi.org/Uploads/CABI/publishing/training-materials/resources-by-interface/cab-direct-user-guides/advanced-searching-cab-abstracts.pdf> - Accessed on 10 October 2019

### **3.5. Reference study searches**

In accordance with the 2017 EFSA Explanatory note on literature searching (EFSA, 2017), a list of reference publications, complying with the eligibility/inclusion criteria, to test, fine-tune and validate the search strategy as part of the protocol development was used whenever available (**Table 3**).



**Table 3. Translation of intervention/exposure key elements into search terms for MON 89788 literature search in the Web of Science™ Core Collection and CAB Abstracts® databases**

Key elements		Search terms	Comments
<b>GMO general</b>			
<i>Reference publications</i>		Not applicable.	<p>This step is to focus the search on GM related papers.</p> <p>The search terms, free-text terms, controlled vocabularies and the search strings are updated upon identification of a new search term.</p>
<i>Search terms</i>		Genetically modified organism (GMO, GM); Living modified organism (LMO); biotechnology-derived organism (biotech-derived); Genetic engineering (GE); transgenesis (transgene); genetic transformation; genetic manipulation; genetic improvement.	
<i>Web of science™ platform</i>	<i>Search string based on free-text terms using the Topic (TS) field</i>	(TS=(GMO* OR LMO* OR GM OR GE OR transgen*OR ((genetic* OR living OR biotech*) NEAR/5 (modif* OR transform* OR manipulat* OR improv* OR engineer* OR deriv*))))	
	<i>Truncations and spelling variants used and their meanings</i>	GMO* = GMO, GMOs, GMO's GM = GM crop, GM plant, GM crops, GM plants GE = GE crop, GE plant, GE crops, GE plants LMO* = LMO, LMOs, LMO's Transgen* = transgene, transgenic, transgenesis Genetic* = genetic, genetically Biotech* = biotech, biotechnology, biotechnological Modif* = modify, modified, modification Transform* = transform, transformed, transformation Manipulat* = manipulate, manipulated, manipulation Improv* = improve, improved, improvement Engineer* = engineer, engineered, engineering Deriv* = derive, derived	
<i>EBSCOhost platform</i>	<i>Search string based on controlled vocabularies using the Descriptors (DE) field</i>	DE "genetic engineering" OR DE "genetic transformation" OR DE "genetically engineered foods" OR DE "genetically engineered organisms"	

Key elements		Search terms	Comments
Crop name			
Reference publications		Not applicable.	This step is to focus the search on soybean related papers.  The search terms, free-text terms, controlled vocabularies and the search strings are updated upon identification of a new search term.
Search terms		Soybean, <i>Glycine max</i> , soy, soya	
Web of science™ platform	Search string based on free-text terms using the Topic (TS) field	(TS=(soybean* OR soy* OR " <i>Glycine max</i> " OR "G max" OR "soy bean"))	
	Truncations and spelling variants used and their meanings	soybean* = soybean, soybeans, soybean's G max = <i>Glycine max</i>	
EBSCOhost platform	Search string based on controlled vocabularies using the Descriptors (DE) field	DE "soyabeans"	
Intended trait			
Reference publications		1) Lundry <i>et al.</i> (2008) Composition of grain, forage, and processed fractions from second-generation glyphosate-tolerant soybean, MON 89788, is equivalent to that of conventional soybean ( <i>Glycine max</i> L.). Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 56, 4611-4622. 2) Berman <i>et al.</i> (2010) Compositions of forage and seed from second-generation glyphosate-tolerant soybean MON 89788 and insect-protected soybean MON 87701 from Brazil are equivalent to those of conventional soybean ( <i>Glycine max</i> ). Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 58, 6270-6276. 3) Vries and Fehr (2011) Impact of the MON89788 event for glyphosate tolerance on agronomic and seed traits of soybean. Crop Science, 51, 1023-1027. 4) Horak <i>et al.</i> (2015) Plant characterization of Roundup Ready 2 Yield® soybean, MON 89788, for use in ecological risk assessment. TRANSGENIC RESEARCH, 24, 213-225	

Key elements		Search terms	Comments
Search terms		Glyphosate/ roundup tolerance	
Web of science <sup>TM</sup> platform	Search string based on free-text terms using the Topic (TS) field	(TS=((TOLERAN* OR RESISTAN* OR PROTEC*) NEAR/5 (GLYPHOSATE OR ROUNDUP)))	
	Truncations and spelling variants used and their meanings	Toleran* = tolerance, tolerant Resistan* = resistance, resistant Protect* = protection, protected	
EBSCOhost platform	Search string based on controlled vocabularies using the Descriptors (DE) field	DE "weed control" AND DE "glyphosate"	
Trade names			
Reference publications		1) Lundry <i>et al.</i> (2008) Composition of grain, forage, and processed fractions from second-generation glyphosate-tolerant soybean, MON 89788, is equivalent to that of conventional soybean ( <i>Glycine max</i> L.). Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 56, 4611-4622. 2) Berman <i>et al.</i> (2010) Compositions of forage and seed from second-generation glyphosate-tolerant soybean MON 89788 and insect-protected soybean MON 87701 from Brazil are equivalent to those of conventional soybean ( <i>Glycine max</i> ). Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 58, 6270-6276. 3) Vries and Fehr (2011) Impact of the MON89788 event for glyphosate tolerance on agronomic and seed traits of soybean. Crop Science, 51, 1023-1027. 4) Horak <i>et al.</i> (2015) Plant characterization of Roundup Ready 2 Yield® soybean, MON 89788, for use in ecological risk assessment. TRANSGENIC RESEARCH, 24, 213-225	
Search terms		Roundup Ready® 2 Yield	
Web of science <sup>TM</sup> platform	Search string based on free-text terms using	(TS=(RoundupReady* OR "Roundup Ready" OR RR OR "second generation" OR RR2Y))	

Key elements		Search terms	Comments
	<i>the Topic (TS) field</i>		
	<i>Truncations and spelling variants used and their meanings</i>	RoundupReady* = RoundupReady®	
EBSCOhost platform	<i>Search string based on free-text terms using the All Text (TX) field</i>	TX (RoundupReady* OR "Roundup Ready" OR RR OR "second generation" OR RR2Y)	
	<i>Truncations and spelling variants used and their meanings</i>	RoundupReady* = RoundupReady®	
Newly expressed protein			
	<i>Reference publications</i>	1) Lundry <i>et al.</i> (2008) Composition of grain, forage, and processed fractions from second-generation glyphosate-tolerant soybean, MON 89788, is equivalent to that of conventional soybean ( <i>Glycine max</i> L.). Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 56, 4611-4622. 2) Berman <i>et al.</i> (2010) Compositions of forage and seed from second-generation glyphosate-tolerant soybean MON 89788 and insect-protected soybean MON 87701 from Brazil are equivalent to those of conventional soybean ( <i>Glycine max</i> ). Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 58, 6270-6276. 3) Vries and Fehr (2011) Impact of the MON89788 event for glyphosate tolerance on agronomic and seed traits of soybean. Crop Science, 51, 1023-1027. 4) Horak <i>et al.</i> (2015) Plant characterization of Roundup Ready 2 Yield® soybean, MON 89788, for use in ecological risk assessment. TRANSGENIC RESEARCH, 24, 213-225.	
	<i>Search terms</i>	CP4 EPSPS	

Key elements		Search terms	Comments
Web of science <sup>TM</sup> platform	Search string based on free-text terms using the Topic (TS) field	(TS=(cp4epsps OR "cp4 epsps"))	
	Truncations and spelling variants used and their meanings	The options shown in the search string above are spelling variants. Truncations are not applicable.	
EBSCOhost platform	Search string based on free-text terms using the All Text (TX) field	TX (cp4epsps OR "cp4 epsps")	
	Truncations and spelling variants used and their meanings	The options shown in the search string above are spelling variants. Truncations are not applicable.	
Event			
	Reference publications	1) Lundry <i>et al.</i> (2008) Composition of grain, forage, and processed fractions from second-generation glyphosate-tolerant soybean, MON 89788, is equivalent to that of conventional soybean ( <i>Glycine max</i> L.). Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 56, 4611-4622. 2) Berman <i>et al.</i> (2010) Compositions of forage and seed from second-generation glyphosate-tolerant soybean MON 89788 and insect-protected soybean MON 87701 from Brazil are equivalent to those of conventional soybean ( <i>Glycine max</i> ). Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 58, 6270-6276. 3) Vries and Fehr (2011) Impact of the MON89788 event for glyphosate tolerance on agronomic and seed traits of soybean. Crop Science, 51, 1023-1027. 4) Horak <i>et al.</i> (2015) Plant characterization of Roundup Ready 2 Yield® soybean, MON 89788, for use in ecological risk assessment. TRANSGENIC RESEARCH, 24, 213-225.	
	Search terms	MON 89788	

Key elements		Search terms	Comments
<i>Web of science™ platform</i>	<i>Search string based on free-text terms using the Topic (TS) field</i>	(TS=(MON89788 OR "MON 89788"))	
	<i>Truncations and spelling variants used and their meanings</i>	The options shown in the search string above are spelling variants. Truncations are not applicable.	
<i>EBSCOhost platform</i>	<i>Search string based on free-text terms using the All Text (TX) field</i>	TX (MON89788 OR "MON 89788")	
	<i>Truncations and spelling variants used and their meanings</i>	The options shown in the search string above are spelling variants. Truncations are not applicable.	

### 3.6. Information sources

#### 3.6.1. Electronic bibliographic databases

Based on the coverage and relevance of the journals included, Bayer selects the Web of Science™ Core Collection database<sup>10</sup> and the CAB Abstracts® database<sup>11</sup> for performing the literature searches. The advanced literature search was conducted using the Web of Science™ platform<sup>4</sup> for the Web of Science™ Core collection database and using the EBSCOhost platform<sup>6</sup> for the CAB Abstracts® database<sup>3</sup>.

The Web of Science™ Core Collection database<sup>10</sup> includes literature captured under the following two catalogues: 1) the Science Citation Index Expanded (1995-present); and 2) the Conference Proceedings Citation Index-Science (1990-present). These catalogues offer a complete view of item from a journal, including original research articles, reviews, editorials, chronologies, conference proceedings, bulletins, monographs, and technical reports. This database is “*indisputably the largest citation database available, with over 1 billion cited reference connections indexed from high quality peer reviewed journals, books and proceedings. Each cited reference is meticulously indexed to ensure that it is searchable and attributes credit to the appropriate publication.*”<sup>10</sup>. Further, The Web of Science™ Core Collection database is connected to Google Scholar to allow a seamless movement between the open web and the Web of Science™ Core Collection for the literature search<sup>10</sup>.

The CAB Abstracts® database<sup>11</sup> includes literature capture under the CAB Abstracts (1972-present) catalogue. This catalogue offers a complete view of items from a journal, including original research articles, reviews, books, conference proceedings/ papers, correspondences, editorials, patents, thesis, reports, and bulletins on international agricultural literature, including plant protection, animal husbandry, animal and plant breeding, genetics, and nutrition.

All journals included in the two databases must go through a verification process and as a minimum requirement, non-English language journals must include English-language bibliographic information (title, abstract, keywords) and be peer-reviewed. In general, English is considered the universal language of science<sup>12</sup>. For this reason, the journals most important to the international research community will publish either full text or a minimum of bibliographic information in English, which is especially true in the scientific domain of natural sciences. Full text in English is highly desirable if the journal intends to serve an international community of researchers. Therefore, it is expected that even if there is a relevant article for the food and feed safety of GM plants in a language different than English, the article will include title/abstract/keywords in English, which will guarantee the retrievability of these articles when using keywords and keyword combinations in English.

Based on the above, the selected databases are, to our knowledge, comprehensive, multidisciplinary, conservative sources for literature searching and offer the broadest coverage to retrieve a largest breadth of possible relevant studies. Therefore, additional search sources are not deemed necessary.

---

<sup>10</sup> Web of Science Core Collection; <https://clarivate.com/products/web-of-science/web-science-form/web-science-core-collection/> - Accessed on 10 October 2019

<sup>11</sup> CABI CAB Abstracts® database; <http://www.cabi.org/cab-direct/> - Accessed on 10 October 2019

<sup>12</sup> Web of Science™; <http://wokinfo.com/essays/journal-selection-process/> - Accessed on 10 October 2019

### 3.6.2. Relevant key organisations

In accordance with the 2017 Explanatory note on literature searching (EFSA, 2017) and additional EFSA recommendations, the search in electronic bibliographic databases has been complemented with literature search in internet pages of relevant key organisations involved in the risk assessment of GM plants.

Of the 13 key organisations cited in the 2017 Explanatory note on literature searching (EFSA, 2017), eight<sup>13</sup> are involved in risk assessment of single GM soybean products while two of the remaining five (CIBIOGEM and Environment and Climate Change Canada) are not involved in GM risk assessment. Two (OGTR and GEAC), for the time being, only assess in GM cotton and oilseed rape. The US EPA is only involved in the assessment of events containing Plant-Incorporated Protectants (PIP). Therefore, the internet search focused on the eight key organisations relevant for MON 89788.

For the selection of studies, all records concerning GMO applications and approvals published in the webpages of each relevant key organisation were screened based on 'limits applied' as shown in **Table 4**. Afterwards, all the records within the specified limits were assessed for their relevance to MON 89788 and the results are presented in **Section 5.1.2**.

## 4. SELECTING STUDIES

Studies retrieved from the literature search were screened for their relevance first and then the selected ones were evaluated for their reliability through detailed assessments. Relevance to the search scope and scientific reliability were rigorously assessed by internal and external technical experts.

### 4.1. Process

The process of selecting relevant studies was undertaken in two stages:

- **Rapid assessment** for the relevance based on information in the title and abstract of the studies, to exclude publications that are obviously irrelevant.
- **Detailed assessment** of full-text document if required. Experts with a solid experience in the risk assessment of GM plants and experts with technical experience in the specific area of the selected publication performed this analysis. This stage was conducted to formally assess the identified studies (methodological quality) and the result has then been used to assess if the conclusions on the food/feed safety of the risk assessment, based on the comprehensive weight of evidence, are still valid.

---

<sup>13</sup> Internet pages of the relevant key organisations for MON 89788 soybean:

USDA (<https://www.usda.gov/media>) - Accessed on 10 October 2019;

US FDA (<https://www.fda.gov/>) - Accessed on 10 October 2019;

CFIA (<http://www.inspection.gc.ca/eng/1297964599443/1297965645317>) - Accessed on 10 October 2019;

Health Canada (<https://www.canada.ca/en/health-canada.html>) - Accessed on 10 October 2019;

FSANZ (<http://www.foodstandards.gov.au/Pages/default.aspx>) - Accessed on 10 October 2019;

CTNBio (<http://ctnbio.mcti.gov.br/>) - Accessed on 10 October 2019;

CONABIA(<https://www.argentina.gob.ar/>) - Accessed on 10 October 2019;

Japan MAFF (<http://www.maff.go.jp/e/>) - Accessed on 10 October 2019



## 4.2. Quality assurance

All publications that were identified by the search described in Section 3 have been screened by three different reviewers (one internal and two external experts) with solid experience in the risk assessment of GM plants.

In case of disagreements on eligibility for the inclusion of studies, the reviewers discuss together. If uncertainty remains, the study is *de facto* included for further consideration.

## 4.3. Eligibility/inclusion criteria to establish relevance

From the full reference list of retrieved hits, taking into account i) the review question, ii) the scope of the application, *i.e.* authorisation of MON 89788 soybean for all uses as any other soybean but excluding cultivation in the EU and iii) the eligibility criteria to establish the relevance of retrieved studies, an assessment was conducted in order to conclude whether a certain publication was considered relevant or not. When a publication was considered relevant, the category the publication belongs to is indicated. The following is a non-exhaustive list of categories publications can belong to:

### *Food/Feed safety assessment*

- Molecular characterisation
- Protein expression
- Crop composition
- Agronomic and phenotypic characteristics
- Toxicology - Animal feeding / *In vitro*
- Allergenicity of the protein or the whole food/feed
- Nutrition
- Protein / DNA/ RNA fate in digestive tract

### *Environmental safety assessment*

- Spillage and consequences thereof

It should be noted that the selection criteria are well defined and reassessed annually.

## 5. SUMMARISING AND REPORTING THE DATA, AND CONSIDERING THE IMPLICATIONS OF THE FINDINGS

### 5.1. Search outcomes

#### 5.1.1. Outcomes of literature search in electronic bibliographic databases

The literature search was run using Web of Science<sup>TM</sup> Core Collection and the CAB Abstracts<sup>®</sup> databases on a monthly basis, covering the time span June 2018–May 2019. As a result, 34 hits were identified using Web of Science<sup>TM</sup> Core Collection database while 28 hits were retrieved from the search conducted using the CAB Abstracts<sup>®</sup> database.

#### 5.1.2. Outcomes of literature search in internet pages of relevant key organisations

The literature search in the internet pages of the relevant key organisations was conducted on 10 October 2019. The links to the results of the literature search and the summary of the retrieved data are shown in **Table 4**. There was no publication based on primary/original data that needed further assessment.

**Table 4. Results of literature search in internet pages of relevant key organisations for MON 89788 soybean**

Relevant key organisations	Link to relevant information and summary of the retrieved data
USDA	<p><a href="https://www.aphis.usda.gov/aphis/ourfocus/biotechnology/permits-notifications-petitions/petitions/petition-status">https://www.aphis.usda.gov/aphis/ourfocus/biotechnology/permits-notifications-petitions/petitions/petition-status</a> - Accessed on 10 October 2019. The webpage dedicated to petitions for determination of nonregulated status was checked.</p> <p><i>Date of the most recent website update at the time of the search:</i> 26/09/2019</p> <p><i>Date span of the search:</i> 2018-2019</p> <p><i>Limits applied:</i> The list of the petitions was sorted by ‘Effective Date’ and those completed/ released starting from 01/01/2018 were assessed.</p> <p><i>Number of records retrieved matching the abovementioned criteria:</i> “5”.</p> <p><i>Number of relevant records or full-text documents retrieved:</i> The retrieved records are not relevant to MON 89788.</p>
US FDA	<p><a href="https://www.accessdata.fda.gov/scripts/fdcc/?set=Biocon">https://www.accessdata.fda.gov/scripts/fdcc/?set=Biocon</a> – Accessed on 10 October 2019. The webpage dedicated to biotechnology consultations on food from GE plant varieties was checked.</p> <p><i>Date of the most recent website update at the time of the search:</i> 05/09/2019</p> <p><i>Date span of the search:</i> 2018-2019</p> <p><i>Limits applied:</i> The list of the consultations starting from the ‘FDA Letter Date’ of Jan 1, 2018 was assessed.</p> <p><i>Number of records retrieved matching the abovementioned criteria:</i> “7”.</p> <p><i>Number of relevant records or full-text documents retrieved:</i> The retrieved records are not relevant to MON 89788.</p>

Relevant key organisations	Link to relevant information and summary of the retrieved data
CFIA	<p><a href="http://www.inspection.gc.ca/plants/plants-with-novel-traits/approved-under-review/decision-documents/eng/1303704378026/1303704484236">http://www.inspection.gc.ca/plants/plants-with-novel-traits/approved-under-review/decision-documents/eng/1303704378026/1303704484236</a> - Accessed on 10 October 2019. The webpage dedicated to decision documents – determination of environmental and livestock feed safety was checked.</p> <p><i>Date of the most recent website update at the time of the search:</i> 28/05/2019</p> <p><i>Date span of the search:</i> 2018 – 2019</p> <p><i>Limits applied:</i> The list of decision documents starting from the DD No. = DD2018 was assessed.</p> <p><i>Number of records retrieved matching the abovementioned criteria:</i> “2”.</p> <p><i>Number of relevant records or full-text documents retrieved:</i> The retrieved records are not relevant to MON 89788.</p>
Health Canada	<p><a href="https://www.canada.ca/en/health-canada/services/food-nutrition/genetically-modified-foods-other-novel-foods/approved-products.html">https://www.canada.ca/en/health-canada/services/food-nutrition/genetically-modified-foods-other-novel-foods/approved-products.html</a> - Accessed on 10 October 2019. The webpage dedicated to approved products of genetically modified (GM) foods and other novel foods was checked.</p> <p><i>Date of the most recent website update at the time of the search:</i> 26/06/2019</p> <p><i>Date span of the search:</i> 2018-2019</p> <p><i>Limits applied:</i> The list of novel food decisions starting from the ‘Decision Date’ of 01/01/2018 was assessed.</p> <p><i>Number of records retrieved matching the abovementioned criteria:</i> “7”.</p> <p><i>Number of relevant records or full-text documents retrieved:</i> The retrieved records are not relevant to MON 89788.</p>
FSANZ	<p><a href="http://www.foodstandards.gov.au/consumer/gmfood/applications/Pages/default.aspx">http://www.foodstandards.gov.au/consumer/gmfood/applications/Pages/default.aspx</a> - Accessed on 10 October 2019. The webpage dedicated to current GM applications and approvals was checked.</p> <p><i>Date of the most recent website update at the time of the search:</i> August 2019</p> <p><i>Date span of the search:</i> 2018-2019</p> <p><i>Limits applied:</i> The list for GM applications and approvals with ‘Status’ approved or under assessment starting from 2018 was assessed.</p> <p><i>Number of records retrieved matching the abovementioned criteria:</i> “5”.</p> <p><i>Number of relevant records or full-text documents retrieved:</i> The retrieved records are not relevant to MON 89788.</p>

Relevant key organisations	Link to relevant information and summary of the retrieved data
CTNBio	<p><a href="http://ctnbio.mcti.gov.br/liberacao-comercial#/liberacao-comercial/consultar-processo">http://ctnbio.mcti.gov.br/liberacao-comercial#/liberacao-comercial/consultar-processo</a> – Accessed on 10 October 2019. The webpage dedicated to commercial releases (= Liberações Comerciais) was checked.</p> <p><i>Date of the most recent website update at the time of the search:</i> Not clear (several dates mentioned)</p> <p><i>Date span of the search:</i> 2018-2019</p> <p><i>Limits applied:</i> The list of commercial releases for plants (= plantas) starting from 2018 was assessed.</p> <p><i>Number of records retrieved matching the abovementioned criteria:</i> “11”.</p> <p><i>Number of relevant records or full-text documents retrieved:</i> The retrieved records are not relevant to MON 89788.</p>
CONABIA	<p><a href="https://www.argentina.gob.ar/agroindustria/alimentos-y-bioeconomia/ogm-comerciales">https://www.argentina.gob.ar/agroindustria/alimentos-y-bioeconomia/ogm-comerciales</a> – Accessed on 10 October 2019. The webpage of the national advisory commission on agricultural biotechnology (= Comisión Nacional Asesora de Biotecnología Agropecuaria) was checked.</p> <p><i>Date of the most recent website update at the time of the search:</i> Not available</p> <p><i>Date span of the search:</i> 2018-2019</p> <p><i>Limits applied:</i> The list of decision documents open for public comment was assessed. Note: decision documents are available for 60 days to allow the public to give comments and are removed afterwards.</p> <p><i>Number of records retrieved matching the abovementioned criteria:</i> “17”.</p> <p><i>Number of relevant records or full-text documents retrieved:</i> The retrieved records are not relevant to MON 89788.</p>
MAFF	<p><a href="http://www.maff.go.jp/j/syouan/nouan/carta/torikumi/attach/pdf/index-189.pdf">http://www.maff.go.jp/j/syouan/nouan/carta/torikumi/attach/pdf/index-189.pdf</a> - Accessed on 10 October 2019. The weblink dedicated to list of approved genetically modified agricultural crops was checked.</p> <p><i>Date of the most recent website update at the time of the search:</i> 30/05/2019</p> <p><i>Date span of the search:</i> 2018 – 2019</p> <p><i>Limits applied:</i> The list of GM agricultural crops with approval date (‘承認日’) starting from January 01, 2018 was assessed.</p> <p><i>Number of records retrieved matching the abovementioned criteria:</i> “17”.</p> <p><i>Number of relevant records or full-text documents retrieved:</i> The retrieved records are not relevant to MON 89788.</p>

## 5.2. Results of the study selection process for electronic bibliographic databases

The results of the study selection process are provided in **Table 5**. The one relevant study retrieved after detailed assessment of the full text document (ordered by category of information) is listed in **Table 6**. Excluded studies after detailed assessment of the full text documents for relevance are listed in **Table 7**. A copy of the full-text documents listed in **Table 6** are provided as pdf files in the references folder of this document.

**Table 5. Results of the study selection process.**

Review question captured in the search	Number of studies	
	Web of Science™ Core Collection database	CAB Abstracts® database
Total number of <i>studies</i> retrieved after all searches of the scientific literature (excluding duplicates)	34	28
Number of <i>studies</i> excluded from the search results after rapid assessment for relevance	29	26
Total number of <i>full-text documents</i> assessed in detail (excluding duplicates)	5	
Number of <i>studies</i> excluded from further consideration after detailed assessment for relevance	4	
Total number of unobtainable/unclear studies	0	
Total number of relevant studies	1	

**Table 6. Report of all relevant studies retrieved after detailed assessment of full-text documents for relevance: ordered by category of information.**

Study (author(s) and year)	Title	Source
<b>Food/Feed safety assessment</b>		
Protein expression		
Chinnadurai <i>et al.</i> (2018)	Variability of CP4 EPSPS expression in genetically engineered soybean ( <i>Glycine max</i> L. Merrill).	Transgenic Research
<b>Environmental safety assessment</b>		
No relevant studies identified		

**Table 7. Report of studies excluded from the risk assessment after detailed assessment of full-text documents (classified by authors)**

Study Author(s)	Year	Title	Source	Reason(s) for exclusion
Suassuna, ND <i>et al.</i>	2018	BRS 430 B2RF and BRS 432 B2RF: Insect-resistant and glyphosate-tolerant high-yielding cotton cultivars	Crop Breeding and Applied Biotechnology	The hybrid used to conduct the study is not MON 89788
Murua, MG <i>et al.</i>	2018	Defoliation of soybean expressing Cry1Ac by Lepidopteran pests	Insects	It is not a food/feed safety study on MON 89788
Galazzi, RM <i>et al.</i>	2019	Evaluation of some effects on plant metabolism through proteins and enzymes in transgenic and non-transgenic soybeans after cultivation with silver nanoparticles	Journal of Proteomics	The hybrid used to conduct the study is not MON 89788
De Vos, CJ and Swanenburg, M	2018	Health effects of feeding genetically modified (GM) crops to livestock animals: a review	Food and Chemical Toxicology	It is not a food/feed safety study on MON 89788

### 5.3. Implications of the retrieved relevant studies for the risk assessment

Table 8 reports the reliability and implications for the risk assessment of all the relevant studies. The relevant studies did not identify any new information that would require further consideration in the risk assessment of MON 89788 which found no adverse effects on human, animal health and the environment.

The literature search conducted by Bayer provides a comprehensive analysis of reliable scientific publications that are relevant to the food, feed, and environmental safety of MON 89788. Therefore, a systematic review would not add value to the risk assessment of this product.

**Table 8. Report of the reliability and implications for the risk assessment of all relevant studies retrieved after detailed assessment of full-text documents for relevance: ordered by category of information.**

Study author(s) and year	Reliability appraisal <sup>1</sup>	Implications for the risk assessment <sup>2</sup>
Protein expression		
Chinnadurai <i>et al.</i> (2018)	High	None, because no new hazards, modified exposure, or new scientific uncertainties are reported

<sup>1</sup> **High** (use as key study); **Moderate** because the study reported is subject to some limitations (useable as key study depending on the limitations of the study); **Low** because the study reported is subject to several limitations (limited use or not useful; generally not to be used as key study, but depending on the limitations of the study, it may be useful in weight of evidence approaches or as supporting information); **Not reliable** because the study reported does not comply with minimum reliability criteria carrying a high level of uncertainty (not useful); **Not assignable** because no or insufficient information is reported in the study (EFSA, 2017).

<sup>2</sup> Identification of a new hazard, modified exposure, or new scientific uncertainty requiring further consideration in the risk assessment; **None**, because no new hazards, modified exposure, or new scientific uncertainties are reported; **None**, because the findings reported in the study are not reliable; Implications for risk assessment were previously considered by EFSA and/or its GMO Panel, and are therefore not addressed further here (EFSA, 2017).

## **6. CONCLUSION**

Taking into consideration all the above, Bayer confirms that this literature search, conducted in accordance with the 2017 EFSA explanatory note on literature searching (EFSA, 2017) and within the context of general surveillance for MON 89788 in the EU, identified no relevant publications that would invalidate the initial conclusions of the MON 89788 risk assessment. Therefore, the conclusions of the risk assessment as presented in the initial application remain unchanged. No adverse effects are to be expected from authorised uses of MON 89788 in the EU.



## REFERENCES

*References in grey are EFSA publications and are therefore not provided with this response.*

Chinnadurai P, Stojšin D, Liu K, Friedrich G, Glenn KC, Geng T, Schapaugh A, Huang K, Deffenbaugh A, Liu Z and Burzio L, 2018. Variability of CP4 EPSPS expression in genetically engineered soybean (*Glycine max* L. Merrill). *Transgenic Res*, 27, 511-524.

EFSA, 2010. Application of systematic review methodology to food and feed safety assessments to support decision making *The EFSA Journal*, 1637, 1-90.

EFSA, 2017. Explanatory note on literature searching conducted in the context of GMO applications for (renewed) market authorisation and annual post-market environmental monitoring reports on GMOs authorised in the EU market. *EFSA journal*, 2017:EN-1207, 1-48.