



EUROPEAN COMMISSION
HEALTH & CONSUMER PROTECTION DIRECTORATE-GENERAL

Directorate C - Scientific Opinions

C2 - Management of scientific committees; scientific co-operation and networks

Scientific Committee on Food

SCF/CS/PLEN/MINS/134 final

21 November 2002

Minutes of the 134th Plenary Meeting

of the

Scientific Committee on Food

held on 24/25/26 September 2002 in Brussels

Members/Membres/Mitglieder

Mr. J. ALEXANDER
 Mr. A. FLYNN (present on 25-26 September)
 W. GRUNOW
 T. HIRVI
 Mrs. A. KNAAP Chair
 Mr. B. KOLETZKO (present on 25-26 September)
 J.C. LARSEN
 S. LINDGREN
 B. MOSELEY (present on 25-26 September)
 A. PALOU Second Vice chair
 W. SARIS (present on 25 September)
 J. SCHLATTER
 P. TOBBACK
 P. VERGER
 J.-M. WAL (present on 25-26 September)
 R. WALKER

Experts

Mr. P. ELIAS (present on 26 September)
 A. RENWICK (present on 26 September)

Commission/Kommission

Mr. A. KLEPSCH (DG Health and Consumer Protection)
 Mrs. S. HEINIMAA " "
 H. LEE " "
 Mr. G. SCHREIBER " "
 M. SLAYNE " "
 F. VERSTRAETE " "
 L. ROSSI " "

Secretariat/Secrétariat/Sekretariat (DG Health and Consumer Protection)

Mr. M. A. GRANERO ROSELL
 Mrs. T. SÄTERI
 Mr. D. LIEM
 Mrs. P. RODRIGUEZ IGLESIAS
 Mrs. H. PEDERSEN

1. Welcome, apologies for absence

Apologies for absence were received from Dr. S. Barlow, Dr. A. Carere and Dr .K.-H. Engel.

2. Adoption of the agenda

The agenda was adopted with the addition of the item 10.4 “Opinion on the 18th additional list of monomers and additives for food contact materials”.

3. Declarations of interest

No declarations of interest were made.

4. Matters arising from previous plenary meeting

The Committee took note of the adoption of the minutes of the previous 133rd plenary meeting of 1-3 July by written procedure shortly before the plenary.

5. General information from the Commission services on matters relevant to the SCF

It was reported that the Management Board of the European Food Safety Authority met for the first time on 18/19 September. The Management Board has elected a Chair and Vice-Chairs, and has adopted its rules of procedure. The board also took a number of initial operational and administrative decisions. It will continue with its process for the selection of the Executive Director from the short list proposed by the Commission.

The Commission, the EFSA team and the Management Board are preparing the launch of the call for expression of interest to become member of the future Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels of the EFSA. It is expected that the call will be published in the Official Journal in October/November.

As to the staff of the EFSA, the Commission has started to recruit staff to set-up the infrastructure and the scientific secretariat of the EFSA. It is expected that these newly recruited staff will progressively attend the future meetings of the SCF with a view to

help ensure a smooth transition of activities from the Committee to the relevant panels of the EFSA.

The Chair informed the members that given the situation described above, it is likely that the Committee will remain active until the spring of 2003 and requested the Committee to agree on a number of tentative dates for plenary meetings in 2003 (see 5.1).

5.1. Schedule of meetings in 2003

The Committee agreed on tentative dates for meetings in 2003, in the event the Committee would be functioning at that time and this would be necessary.

The agreed dates were the following:

- 3/4/5 March
- 19/20/21 May
- 30 June 1/2 July
- 15/16/17 September

6. Co-ordination with the Scientific Steering Committee and other Scientific Committees

The Chairperson reported on the latest meeting of the SSC. The majority of the opinions adopted were relating to TSEs. She also reported about the information from the Director Mr. Carsin to the SSC about the development of EFSA and the general corresponding adaptations in the structure of the Health and Consumer Protection DG relating the Directorate C "Scientific Opinions".

7. New requests for opinion

The Commission services have received two new requests from two petitioners (MultiBene and Archer Daniels Midland) for authorisation within the framework of Regulation (EC) No. 258/97 for placement of phytosterols and phytosterol esters as novel food ingredients on the market in the Community. With reference to the initial assessment carried out by the Member States' Authorities, and taking into account the relevant comments/objections presented by Member States and pursuant to Article 11 of Regulation (EC) No. 258/97, the Commission has requested the Committee to assess the safety of the use of phytosterols and phytosterol esters in a number of foods as specified by the petitioners.

8. Contaminants

8.1. Polycyclic Aromatic Hydrocarbons in food

The Committee acknowledged the impressive work carried out by the SCF's Task Force on PAH to submit the draft opinion and the background document included in the Annex. The chairman of the Task Force presented the key issues in the draft opinion and explained that a more extensive description of the scientific aspects including further details were included in a separate Annex (will be physically included in the opinion after adoption).

During the discussions the Committee agreed on a number of modifications and re-arrangements in the different chapters of the documents. The Task Force will meet again in October to discuss the modifications suggested and intends to submit a new document to the next plenary meeting of the SCF for final adoption.

8.2. Non-dioxin-like PCBs

The Secretariat distributed a background document to inform the SCF on a project which will be jointly co-ordinated by the European Commission services and WHO Geneva on the risk assessment of dietary exposure to non-dioxin-like PCBs. It is evident that this will be a very complex and time consuming exercise and it has been questioned if SCF's capacity in terms of human resources, means and time would be sufficient to perform this task within the remaining active period of the Committee. Given the situation that the Commission, WHO and US EPA are undertaking initiatives to perform risk assessments of PCBs, officials from these three organisations discussed the possibility to co-operate in order to make progress in this important issue and to avoid duplication of efforts. On the 24th and 25th of June, a working group composed of 20 experts from the US, Canada, Asia, Europe, including members of the SCF met to discuss the work programme, to define the working documents to be prepared, to distribute the work and to identify key-experts to organise the preparation of the working documents. The aim is to deliver a risk assessment report to the Commission before the end of December 2003.

9. Flavourings

9.1. Furfural and furfural diethylacetal

As there was not enough time, the discussion of the draft opinion was deferred until the next plenary meeting of the SCF.

10. Food Contact Materials

10.1. Draft opinion on the 19th list of monomers and additives for food contact materials

The draft opinion of the additional 19th list of compounds prepared by the Working Group was examined by the Committee. There were some clarifications introduced in the draft about number of compounds in the list.

The text of the full opinion as agreed appears as **Annex I** of these minutes.

10.2. Draft opinion on the 20th list of monomers and additives for food contact materials

The draft opinion of the additional 20th list of compounds prepared by the Working Group was examined by the Committee. There were some clarifications introduced in the draft about number of compounds in the list. There were also some further clarification issues regarding the compounds (PM/REF. 20440 and 34240) in the list proposed by the Working Group that could not be resolved at the plenary meeting. The Working Group was therefore asked to consider revised wording for the evaluations regarding these compounds and submit them to the next plenary.

The text of the full opinion as agreed appears as **Annex II** of these minutes.

The Committee could not discuss other evaluations from the Working Group relating to castor oils derivatives and about several trimethylhexane related compounds (15370, 15400, 22331) due to lack of time

10.3. Bisphenol A diglycidyl ether (BADGE)

The Committee examined a proposal for a statement for the minutes prepared by the Working Group about new information regarding Bisphenol A diglycidyl ether (BADGE).

Some members considered they wished to have more detailed information from the Working Group and the Committee decided to charge the working group to prepare a more complete paper for consideration at the next plenary.

10.4. Opinion on the 18th additional list of monomers and additives for food contact materials

As agreed at the previous plenary, the opinion on the 18th additional list of monomers and additives for food contact materials had been circulated for approval by written procedure after the last plenary. Comments had been incorporated in the final version. The revised document had been circulated for final approval by written procedure and therefore was considered adopted.

The full text of the opinion is attached herewith as **Annex III** of these minutes.

11. Food additives

11.1. Draft opinion on benzoic acid and its salts

The draft opinion was presented by a member of the Additives Working Group. In the discussion following, the Committee particularly discussed which other substances than benzoic acid should be included in the proposed Group ADI. The Committee agreed that the group ADI should include benzoic acid and its salts including benzyl alcohol and related benzyl derivatives used as flavourings because of their metabolic relationship.

The draft opinion was adopted subject to incorporation of the changes proposed and the inclusion of a clarification of its opinion as to which substances are included in the Group ADI. The full opinion appears as **Annex IV** of these minutes.

11.2. Draft opinion on benzyl alcohol

The draft opinion was presented and discussed. The Committee agreed to include a recommendation to provide better data on use levels following use of benzyl alcohol as carrier solvents against the background of overall exposure in order to facilitate a more precise intake assessment.

A revised draft including the changes suggested by the Committee was adopted. The full opinion appears as **Annex V** of these minutes.

The Committee decided to issue the following statement, when adopting these two opinions on benzyl alcohol and on the benzoates mentioned before:

“The Committee notes that the intake of benzoic acid, its salts, benzyl alcohol and related benzyl derivatives can result from the use of several food additives and flavourings, as well as from natural occurrence in food. In a recent EU- wide survey (Additives survey COM (2001) 542 final) the Commission identified the benzoates as a group of additives requiring a more refined estimate of intake in children, in order to assess whether there is any likelihood of them exceeding the ADI. The Committee welcomes this call by the Commission and recommends (1) that the estimates should include intake of all the substances included in the Group ADI of 0-5 mg/kg for “benzoates”, (i.e. benzoic acid, its salts, benzyl alcohol and related benzyl derivatives used as flavourings), from all food sources including natural sources, and (2) that separate estimates should be made for adults as well as children.”

11.3. Draft opinion on citric acid esters of mono- and diglycerides (E 472c): request for additional uses in foods for special medical purposes for infants and young children

The Commission services explained the background of the document. The Committee discussed a few changes and a re-arrangement of some paragraphs in the document. The text of the opinion adopted appears as **Annex VI**.

12. Novel foods and novel processes

12.1. Long-term effects of the intake of elevated levels of phytosterols from multiple dietary sources, with particular attention to the effects on beta-carotene

The draft document prepared within the Novel Foods Working Group was introduced and discussed. The document was adopted subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the discussion by the Committee.

The full text as agreed appears as **Annex VII** of these minutes.

12.2. Post launch monitoring (PLM) of “yellow fat spreads with added phytosterol esters”

The draft opinion prepared within the Novel Foods Working Group was introduced and discussed. The opinion was adopted subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the discussion by the Committee.

This document demonstrates the feasibility and the usefulness of PLM to provide relevant results reflecting the actual consumption of a particular food product from one company. The Committee noted that the results cannot be extrapolated to the same type of products with different market shares or to other categories of foodstuffs.

The text of the full opinion as agreed appears as **Annex VIII** of these minutes.

13. Tolerable Upper Intake Levels for Vitamins and Minerals

13.1. Draft Opinion on the tolerable upper intake level of Iodine

The draft opinion prepared by the Working Group was examined by the Committee. The opinion was adopted subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the discussion by the Committee.

The text of the full opinion as agreed appears as **Annex IX** of these minutes.

13.2. Draft Opinion on the tolerable upper intake level of preformed Vitamin A (retinol and retinyl esters)

The draft opinion prepared by the Working Group was examined by the Committee. The opinion was adopted subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the discussion by the Committee.

The text of the full opinion as agreed appears as **Annex X** of these minutes.

13.3. Draft Opinion on the tolerable upper intake level of Zinc

As there was not enough time, the discussion of the draft opinion was deferred until the next plenary meeting of the SCF.

14. Any other business

None

15. Adoption of these minutes

These minutes were adopted by written procedure on 20 November 2002.

ANNEXES

(The text of the opinions adopted in these annexes appear in the section outcome/opinions of the web page of the SCF on the Internet, not in the section outcome/minutes)

ANNEX I

Opinion of the Scientific Committee on Food on the 19th additional list of monomers and additives for food contact materials (SCF/CS/PM/M90 final)

ANNEX II

Opinion of the Scientific Committee on Food on the 20th additional list of monomers and additives for food contact materials (SCF/CS/PM/M91 final)

ANNEX III

Opinion of the Scientific Committee on Food on the 18th additional list of monomers and additives for food contact materials (SCF/CS/PM/M89 final)

ANNEX IV

Opinion of the Scientific Committee on Food on benzoic acid and its salts (SCF/CS/ADD/CONS/48 final)

ANNEX V

Opinion of the Scientific Committee on Food on benzyl alcohol (SCF/CS/ADD/FLAV/78 final)

ANNEX VI

Opinion of the Scientific Committee on Food on citric acid esters of mono- and diglycerides (E 472c) in foods for special medical purposes for infants and young children. (SCF/CS/ADD/MsAd/221 Final)

ANNEX VII

General view of the Scientific Committee on Food on the long-term effects of the intake of elevated levels of phytosterols from multiple dietary sources, with particular attention to the effects on beta-carotene (SCF/CS/NF/DOS/20 ADD 1 Final)

ANNEX VIII

Opinion of the Scientific Committee on Food on a report on Post Launch Monitoring of “yellow fat spreads with added phytosterol esters” (SCF/CS/NF/DOS/21 ADD 2 final)

ANNEX IX

Opinion of the Scientific Committee on Food on the tolerable upper intake level of Iodine (SCF/CS/NUT/UPPLEV/26 final)

ANNEX X

Opinion of the Scientific Committee on Food on the tolerable upper intake level of preformed Vitamin A (retinol and retinyl esters) (SCF/CS/NUT/UPPLEV/24 final)