

## Final Minutes

### **Meeting of the sub-group of the EU platform on Animal Welfare – Animal Transport 21 March 2019, Grange**

This was the third meeting of the transport sub-group. Nineteen members of the sub-group, nine invited experts and one observer attended a third meeting of the transport sub-group in Grange, Ireland on the 21<sup>st</sup> March 2019. This sub-group is dedicated to improve the enforcement of EU legislation on animal transport.

Mr Carro-Perez gave an update from the last meeting and outlined the procedure for the Platform to adopt a document. Ms Kuzma indicated that the provisional date for the next meeting of the EU platform on Animal Welfare is 17 June 2019. This has since been confirmed.

The Netherlands representative gave an update on behalf of the working group on extreme temperatures and indicated that part of their work had already been uploaded on the Digital Tool. The UECEBV representative gave an update on behalf of the working group on exports of cattle. Several members mentioned the decision of some German regions to suspend the exports of live animals to third countries, based on animal welfare concerns. Mr Velarde gave an update on behalf of the working group on unweaned animals, he clarified that they have focused on calves as they constitute the most common transport of unweaned animals, alongside lambs.

The VIER PFOTEN representative asked whether DG SANTE would endorse the work of the Platform and its subgroups, including allowing the use of the logo on the documents that will be produced, as the Commissioner had indicated at a meeting in the European Parliament in November 2018 that DG SANTE would consider this issue further. Ms Kuzma replied that the issue of the Platform (extension of the mandate, voluntary initiatives) will be discussed at a meeting of SANTE senior management at the end of March, and a possible point of follow up of the work of the subgroups may be raised. Ms Kuzma indicated that any evaluation of the subgroup's work would include whether the action is in line with the Platform's mandate and the current Commission's priorities. The content of the agendas for the meetings of the Platform is defined by Commissioner's Cabinet and this is where the work of the sub-group would be adopted. Several members said they had already requested clarification at the first meeting of the subgroup as to how advice would be acted on, and if there was funding for the translation of documents. Ms Kuzma indicated that the subgroup should be clear in its advice as to who will do what. Ms Kuzma said that the allocation of work to the Commission is unlikely to be fruitful due to insufficient resources. In relation to problems being experienced in the uploading of documents to the digital tool, Ms Kuzma reminded members that support for using the digital tool is available by e-mailing Aude Luyckx at [SANTE-ANIMAL-WELFARE-PLATFORM@ec.europa.eu](mailto:SANTE-ANIMAL-WELFARE-PLATFORM@ec.europa.eu)

Mr Micu and Mr Paun described an initiative which is supported by the Romanian Government which allows citizens to consult, via an app, the status of trucks which transport felled trees, and to report this to the Police if they could not confirm the legality of such transport. Several members of the subgroup had a major ethical and legal concern with giving the public access to similar information on animal transport. Mr Micu indicated that an App could be designed to provide advantages for the industry, e.g. to make information more easily available to authorities. The AVEC representative said it was not clear why this work had been presented and regretted that sufficient time had not been allocated to debate this.

The working groups held separate meetings related to their specific tasks. The following was noted in relation to outputs from the three working groups:

## 1. Exports of cattle

- The document "Advice to the Commission on the co-ordination of actions for journeys to Non EU countries" to be revised and a conference call organised for this working group (Action Compassion in World Farming/UECBV).
- Review factsheet for organisers, entire subgroup to provide comments (Action subgroup - UECVB to lead).
- Regarding facilities to unload animals in non EU countries which operate in a way equivalent to Control Posts, UECBV did not succeed in producing a list of these premises. The OIE representative indicated that they are also working on this and hope to have made progress on it by the end of April. They will hold a focal point meeting in June 2019 (Action OIE).
- Possibilities to develop an App:
  - Mr Antunes clarified that the subgroup should identify the need for, and the value from, developing such an App. The development of an App was not a task for the subgroup *per se*. The possibilities of links with certain functions in TRACES need to be further considered.
  - The UECBV representative agreed to investigate implications for data protection (Action UECBV).
  - The Germany representative agreed to define the needs of an inspector, to be considered in any proposal (Action Germany).
  - Mr Kardos agreed to reply to a proposal, to be prepared by Mr Micu, on which data from transporters' systems could be made available for capture by the App, depending on possible different user's level of access.
  - The UECBV representative stated that the discussion in the group is still in the preliminary stages and that the group has not yet endorsed the development of such an App and will wait for further inputs and discussions in the next meeting.
- The UECBV representative said that he would also use the communication proposal developed by the "Extreme Temperature" group for the work on exports (Action UECBV/ in consultation with Compassion in World Farming).
- The Netherlands representative regretted that the group had stopped their activities to draw up a list with resting points and their capacities outside EU borders. In her opinion there is a need for such a list.
- There was limited time to discuss transport by sea, The Compassion in World Farming representative agreed to send a revised draft document to UECBV. UECBV will then revise it further and circulate in the working group. Thereafter, a conference call will be held to discuss this (Action Compassion in World Farming/UECBV).

## 2. Extreme Temperatures

- Five factsheets for the transport of five different species during extreme temperatures based on extracts from the Animal Transport Guides<sup>1</sup>. Further comments to be submitted to the Netherlands representative by 1 May 2019, highlighting the legally binding points

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://animaltransportguides.eu>

The final report on the Animal Transport Guides project which was validated by the Commission services, is available in DG SANTE website at [https://ec.europa.eu/food/sites/food/files/animals/docs/aw\\_prac\\_transport\\_pilot-report.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/food/sites/food/files/animals/docs/aw_prac_transport_pilot-report.pdf) and in the Platform digital tool at <https://webgate.ec.europa.eu/awp/item/item/2471>

(Action the working group). After this, the factsheets will be published on the digital tool for feedback of all members of the subgroup.

- Ms Sossidou agreed to revise a document on a communication proposal to indicate how information and materials produced by the working groups could be delivered to key users. Mr Jonas, an invited expert from a major transport company, pointed out that drivers did not need any more printed documents and that his company had developed an App to give access to details of each of their 75 trucks (different designs for pigs, sheep and cattle), and which includes an algorithm to calculate space allowances for each truck. The group considered it more effective to deliver information, e.g. the factsheets, via an App. An App developed by the New Zealand Government to promote compliance could also serve as inspiration.
- Regarding the other work of the group, scenario/solution documents and research gaps, time was too short for a meaningful discussion. Mr Cassidy pointed out that research gaps are not a priority for the moment.

### 3. Unweaned Animals

- Defined scientifically prolonged hunger for 2-5 week old calves, but not the extent and severity for such calves during long distance transport or how this can be detected in practice.
- Mr Velarde indicated that the group could not define what constitutes "undue suffering" (Article 3 of Regulation 1/2005) in the context of this transport.
- Mr Velarde provided a reference to a scientific paper, Fisher et al (2014), which concludes that calves can cope without food for 24 hours.
- The group will search for additional scientific references, in order to define the needs of a calf in relation to energy required (number of megajoules) and how travel times in the legislation (e.g. 9h transport +1h rest +9 hours further transport) fit these needs and the needs of a calf in relation to frequency of feeding. The group will consider further the requirement that calves are "if necessary fed" after nine hours of transport. They will also consider how a one hour stop fits the need for rest and "if necessary fed".
- There was insufficient time to discuss thermal comfort during this transport; the aim prior to the meeting.
- Possible Animal Based Measures (to use as indicators) were discussed, but again time was too short to conclude on these.

### General points

The Compassion in World Farming representative indicated that Commission audits indicated that the *Zuchtvieh* ruling is largely ignored by the Member States and the Commission should advise Member States on the practical implications of this ruling.

The Germany representative reminded the extreme temperature group of the need to address risks from transport during very cold conditions, such as during exports to Uzbekistan.

The Animals' Angels representative indicated that regarding the recurring risk for exports to Turkey in summer, the Commission should co-ordinate the approach of the Member States so that there is a *de facto* ban on exports during periods of high temperatures. The Netherlands representative agreed that it was an important issue that needs to be discussed in the Extreme temperature group.

The Netherlands and Germany representatives both complained that the Commission is agreeing export certificates for animals for slaughter. The policy in both the Netherlands and Germany is to only export breeding animals.

The Netherlands representative asked for possible discussions in the export group regarding export of meat instead of export of slaughter animals. She indicated that it is a topic that was part of a recent resolution of the European Parliament and it is also currently being discussed in the Netherlands. The Animals' Angels representative supported the suggestion.

The VIER PFOTEN representative welcomed the proposals of Apps or other activities. In his opinion if such activities are finally approved and funded by the EU this would give meaning to his organisation's presence in the subgroup and that all means that can help to enforce legislation are welcome.

There was a general consensus that the subgroup needs at least one day and a half to allow for meaningful discussions, especially as a lot of work is done between meetings but then this also needs to be discussed face to face.

### **Next Meeting**

The fourth meeting of the transport sub-group is scheduled for Wednesday 4<sup>th</sup> to Thursday 5<sup>th</sup> September 2019.

### **List of Participants**

**European Commission: DG Health and Food Safety:** Vasco Antunes, Patrick Caruana, Terence Cassidy, Marguerite Kuzma, Desmond Maguire, Patricia Purcell, and Ignacio Carro-Perez.

**Member States:** Bulgaria, Czech Republic, Germany, Hungary, Ireland, the Netherlands and Spain.

**International Organisations:** OIE.

**Business and Professional Organisations:** Association of Poultry Processors and Poultry Trade in the EU (AVEC), Federation of Veterinarians of Europe (FVE), International Society for Applied Ethology (ISAE), European Livestock and Meat Trading Union (UECBV).

**Civil Society Organisations:** Animals' Angels, Compassion in World Farming, Eurogroup for Animals, VIER PFOTEN International (VIER PFOTEN).

**Independent Experts:** Evangelia Sossidou, Antonio Velarde Calvo.

**Invited Experts:** Tea Dronjić, Administration of the Republic of Slovenia for Food Safety; Gabriel Paun, Animals International; Bogdan Micu, Code 4 Nature; Michael Marahrens, Federal Research Institute for Animal Health, Germany; József Kardos, Hunland; Róbert Jónás, Hunland; Raoul Maas, Pali Group, the Netherlands; Markus Krumpel, UECBV; Javier Sánchez Álvarez, UECBV.

**Observer:** European Agri-Cooperatives (COGECA).